

The Journal of the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

The *Journal of Medical Ethics* was established in 1975, with a multi-disciplinary Editorial Board, to promote the study of contemporary medico-moral problems. The Editorial Board has as its aims the encouragement of a high academic standard for this developing subject and the influencing of the quality of both professional and public discussion. The *Journal* is published quarterly. The *Journal* includes papers on all aspects of medical ethics, analyses ethical concepts and theories and features case conferences and comment on clinical practice. It includes book reviews and details of lectures and symposia on issues raised by the practice of medicine.

Editorial Board

EDITOR:

Raanan Gillon, BA (PHILOSOPHY), MB, BS, MRCP, Assistant Director, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics; Director, Imperial College Health Service, University of London.

CONSULTING EDITORS:

Sir Douglas Black, President, Royal College of Physicians.
D W Hamlyn, Professor of Philosophy, Birkbeck College, University of London and Editor of *Mind*.

EDITORIAL BOARD:

Thomas Oppé, Chairman, Professor of Paediatrics, St Mary's Hospital Medical School, London.

K M Boyd, Scottish Director, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics, Edinburgh.

Alastair Campbell, Senior Lecturer, Department of Christian Ethics and Practical Theology, University of Edinburgh.

A W Clare, Senior Lecturer, Institute of Psychiatry, University of London.

Robin Downie, Professor of Moral Philosophy, Glasgow.

A S Duncan, Emeritus Professor of Medical Education, University of Edinburgh.

C M Fletcher, Emeritus Professor of Clinical Epidemiology, University of London.

Michael F Green, Consultant Physician, The Royal Free Hospital, London.

R M Hare, White's Professor of Moral Philosophy and Fellow of Corpus Christi College, Oxford.

Roger Higgs, General Practitioner, London.

Gerard J Hughes, SJ, Department of Philosophy, Heythrop College, London.

Peter Huntingford, Consultant, Obstetrics and Gynaecology, West Kent General Hospital, Maidstone.

Margot Jeffreys, Emeritus Professor of Medical Sociology, Bedford College, London.

Ian Kennedy, Reader in Law, King's College, London.

Raymond Plant, Professor of Politics, Southampton.

Sir Desmond Pond, Chief Scientist, Department of Health and Social Security.

Sir Martin Roth, Professor of Psychiatry, Cambridge.

Robert Sells, Director, Renal Transplant Unit, Liverpool Royal Infirmary, Liverpool.

Gerald Stern, Consultant Neurologist, University College Hospital, London.

R B Welbourn, Emeritus Professor of Surgical Endocrinology, Royal Postgraduate Medical School, London.

Eric Wilkes, Professor of Community Care and General Practice, University of Sheffield.

Bernard Williams, Provost, King's College, Cambridge.

Edward Shott, Director of Studies, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics, *ex officio*.

TECHNICAL EDITOR:

Ann Lloyd, London.

Submitting manuscripts for publication

Papers submitted for publication should be sent in triplicate to: The Editor, *Journal of Medical Ethics*, Tavistock House North, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9LG. Rejected manuscripts are not returned unless accompanied by a stamped addressed envelope, or international reply coupon. Papers should be in double-spaced typewriting on one side of the paper only. On a separate sheet a brief entry for 'Contributors to this issue' should be supplied, containing the title of the author's present post, degrees and/or professional qualifications, and any other relevant information.

Four copies of the *Journal* will be sent to authors free of charge after their papers are published. Offprints of individual papers may be bought from The Publisher, *Journal of Medical Ethics*, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

In March 1981 the *JME* adopted a simplified 'Vancouver style' for references: details are given in various issues including December 1982, p 218. They are also available from the editorial office. The full text of the 'Vancouver Agreement' was published in the *British medical journal* in 1982; Volume 284; 1725/1814. As the 'Vancouver style' is incompatible with the long established style of references for legal articles, lawyers should use their own standard style, but avoid abbreviations so as to facilitate reference by others. The *Journal* is multidisciplinary and papers should be in clear jargon-free English, accessible to any intelligent reader.

Notice to subscribers

The *Journal of Medical Ethics* is published quarterly. The annual subscription rates are £22.00 in the United Kingdom and Irish Republic, and US \$56.00 in all countries overseas. Payment for overseas subscriptions should be made in dollars, ie, US \$56.00, or in your national currency based on the prevailing exchange rate to the US dollar of that currency, payable to Professional and Scientific Publications/JME A/c. Orders can also be placed locally with any leading subscription agent or bookseller. (For the convenience of readers in the USA subscription orders, with or without payment, can also be sent to: Professional and Scientific Publications, 1172 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Mass. 02134. All enquiries, however, must be addressed to the Publisher in London). All enquiries regarding air mail rates, single copies, advertisements, etc. should be sent to: The Publisher, *Journal of Medical Ethics*, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

ISSN 0306-6800

Copyright © 1983 *Journal of Medical Ethics*. All Rights Reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the *Journal of medical ethics*.

Thematic review and index

The thematic review of past issues appears in the June issue each year and an index to each volume appears in the December issue.

against the more general target of any definition of death in terms of brain function. I have attempted to show why his arguments fail against each of these targets. I have suggested elsewhere, however, that just as brain death is the necessary and sufficient component of human death so is brain-stem death the necessary and sufficient component of brain death (11). Brain stem death can moreover readily be identified clinically. But that is another issue.

References

- (1) Beresford H R. Cognitive death: differential problems and legal overtones. *Annals of the New York Academy of Science* 1978; 315: 339–348.
- (2) Pallis C. An ABC of brain stem death. *British medical journal* 1982; 285: 1409–1412.
- (3) Veatch R M. The definition of death: ethical philosophical and policy confusion. *Annals of the New York Academy of Science* 1978; 315: 307–321.
- (4) Ad Hoc Committee of the Harvard Medical School. A definition of irreversible coma. *Journal of the American Medical Association* 1964; 205: 85–88.
- (5) Mollaret P, Goulon M. Le coma dépassé (mémoire préliminaire). *Revue neurologique* 1959; 101: 3–15.
- (6) Jennett B, Plum F. Persistent vegetative state after brain damage: a syndrome in search of a name. *Lancet* 1972; 1: 734–737.
- (7) Pallis C. An ABC of brain stem death. *British medical journal* 1983; 286: 123–124.
- (8) Jørgensen E O. Spinal man after brain death. *Acta neurochirurgica* 1973; 28: 259–273.
- (9) Jennett B, Gleave J, Wilson P. Brain death in three neurosurgical units. *British medical journal* 1981; 282: 533–539.
- (10) Pallis C. An ABC of brain stem death. *British medical journal* 1983; 286: 209–210.
- (11) Pallis C. *An ABC of brain stem death*. London: *British medical journal*, 1983.

Contributors to this issue

Alan G Johnson is Professor of Surgery at the University of Sheffield.

David Belgium is Professor of religion in the University of Iowa's School of Religion and Head of Pastoral Services at University of Iowa Hospitals and Clinics.

Diana Brahams is a barrister practising in Lincoln's Inn London.

Malcolm Brahams is a solicitor practising in London.

Peter Ferguson is an undergraduate in his final year of Honours in Scots Law at the University of Edinburgh.

John Havard is the Secretary of the British Medical Association.

The Right Revd John Habgood is the Bishop of Durham and has for nine years been Chairman of a working group which has published a series of studies on various problems in medical ethics.

Kenneth M Boyd is Scottish Director of the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics.

Alister Browne is an Instructor in Philosophy at the University of British Columbia, Capilano College and Douglas College. He has published in the areas of philosophy of mind, social philosophy and medical ethics (his current research interest).

C Pallis is Reader Emeritus at the Royal Postgraduate Medical School and Consultant Neurologist at Hammersmith Hospital, London.

Mark S Komrad is a senior medical student at Duke University School of Medicine, Durham, North Carolina.

Brendan Callaghan, SJ, (Society of Jesus), is a Clinical Psychologist and Lecturer in Pastoral Theology at Heythrop College.

Gregory Stone is a barrister.

Luke Zander is a General Practitioner and Senior Lecturer in the Department of General Practice, St Thomas's Hospital, London.

Alastair Campbell is Senior Lecturer, Department of Christian Ethics and Practical Theology, University of Edinburgh.

Case conference editor

Roger Higgs, 81 Brixton Water Lane, London SW2 1PH.

American correspondent

Bernard Towers, Department of Pediatrics, University of California at Los Angeles.

Lectures and symposia

Thursday 10 March

EMG seminar: DEALING WITH DYING PATIENTS. 1 pm Library, Eastern General Hospital, Edinburgh
Dr J F Munro, Medical Unit, Eastern General Hospital
Sister Jenny Whelan, Department of Clinical Oncology, Western General Hospital
Mrs Maureen Walker

Oxford Medical Forum meeting: RESEARCH USING ANIMALS. 8.30 pm Green College, Seminar Room, Woodstock Road
Dr Marion Dawkins, Mary Snow Fellow in Biological Sciences, Somerville College, Oxford
Professor Sir William Paton, Professor of Pharmacology, University of Oxford

Wednesday 16 March

SMG symposium: THE STIGMA OF MENTAL ILLNESS. 5.30 pm Lecture Theatre 2, South Academic Block, Southampton General Hospital
The Revd J Sharpe, Psychiatric Services Chaplain, Knowle Hospital and Vice-Chairman MIND
Dr Brenda Morris, Consultant Psychiatrist, Knowle Hospital
Mr F H Quick, Personnel Services Manager, Southern Gas
Mr Terry Hammond, Area Manager, Stonham Housing Association

Tuesday 12 April

LMG illustrated symposium: WHY TREAT PREGNANCY AS AN ILLNESS? 5.45 pm Middlesex Hospital
John Guillebaud, Senior Lecturer in Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Middlesex Hospital Medical School

R W Beard, Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, St Mary's Hospital Medical School
Sheila Kitzing, Childbirth Specialist
Ann Oakley, National Perinatal Epidemiology Unit, Radcliffe Infirmary, Oxford

Thursday 14 April

Oxford Medical Forum: REFORM OF THE MENTAL HEALTH ACT. 8.30 pm Green College, Seminar Room, Woodstock Road
Dr Seymour Spencer, Consultant Psychiatrist
Dr Larry Gostin, Legal Adviser, MIND
Professor R Bluglass, Professor of Forensic Psychiatry, Birmingham University

LMG illustrated symposium: NO KIND OF LOVING: The plight of the homeless child. 5.45 pm Royal Free Hospital, Hampstead
Joan Cornwell, Consultant Child Psychiatrist, Royal Free Hospital
Iain Dresser, Consultant Child Psychiatrist, Paddington Green Children's Hospital
Alan Gilmour, Director, NSPCC
Mary Wedlake, Ex-Chief Superintendent, Metropolitan Police

Tuesday 19 April

LMG symposium: STILLBIRTH: Grieving for no one? 5.45 pm St Bartholomew's Hospital
Gordon Bourne, Senior Obstetrician and Gynaecologist, St Bartholomew's Hospital
Hugh Jolly, Consultant Paediatrician, Charing Cross Hospital
Hazelanne Lewis, Director, The Stillbirth Association

Thursday 21 April

LMG symposium: THE IRONY OF MALTREATMENT: An institutional hazard. 6 pm St George's Hospital Tooting
Joan Bicknell, Professor of the Psychiatry of Mental Handicap, St George's Hospital Medical School
G F Harris, Medical Administrator, St Lawrence's Hospital, Caterham
Maureen Oswin, Research Officer, Thomas Coram Research Unit
Peggy Jay, Chairman of the Committee of Enquiry into the Training of Mental Handicap Nursing and Care Staff

Tuesday 26 April

EMG symposium: ANTE-NATAL DIAGNOSIS - THE RISKS AND BENEFITS? 5.15 pm Seminar Room, 1st floor, Department of Biochemistry, Hugh Robson Building
Ms Kathy Polanshek, Secretary, Edinburgh Local Health Council
Dr John B Scrimgeour, Consultant, Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Western General Hospital

LMG symposium: RAPE: Fact, Fantasy or Feminist Issue? 5.45 pm St Mary's Hospital
Frank Loeffler, Consultant Gynaecologist, St Mary's Hospital
P M Imbert, Chief Constable, Thames Valley Police
Lord Justice Lawton
Norma Williams, Medical Director, Department of Community Health, Tower Hamlets

Thursday 28 April

Leicester Medical Group symposium: PSYCHIATRIC EXCUSES AND THE MODERN CRIMINAL LAW. 5.30 pm Lecture Theatre, Clinical Sciences Building, Leicester Royal Infirmary

Professor S Brandon, Professor of Psychiatry, University of Leicester Medical School

Professor Nigel Walker, Wolfson Professor of Criminology and Fellow of Kings College, Cambridge

LMG illustrated symposium: NO PLACE LIKE HOME: The unnecessary admission of children to hospital. 5.45 pm St Thomas's Hospital

D C Morrell, Wolfson Professor of General Practice, St Thomas's Hospital Medical School

Graham Curtis Jenkins, General Practitioner Paediatrician

Thomas Oppé, Professor of Paediatrics, St Mary's Hospital Medical School

Priscilla Alderson, National Association for the Welfare of Children in Hospital

Tuesday 3 May

LMG symposium: PLACEBO OR ANALGESIC: Has acupuncture a place in medicine? 5.45 pm University College Hospital

P J Verrill, Consultant Anaesthetist, University College Hospital

Joan Hester, Consultant Anaesthetist to the Eastbourne Group of Hospitals

J H Wolstencroft, Professor of Physiology, University of Birmingham

Wednesday 4 May

AMG debate: MEDICAL RECORDS – FOR WHOSE EYES ONLY? 7.30 pm Senior Common Room, Central Refectory, University of Aberdeen, Old Aberdeen
Chairperson: Douglas Cusine, Senior Lecturer in Law, King College

Thursday 5 May

SMG symposium: MEDICAL SECRECY: Notes and confidentiality. 5.30 pm Lecture Theatre 2, South Academic Block, Southampton General Hospital
Professor E D Acheson, Professor of Clinical Epidemiology

Dame Elizabeth Ackroyd, Chairman, Patients' Association
Mr John Garfield, Consultant Neurosurgeon, Southampton General Hospital

LMG symposium: WHOSE MORALITY? The dilemma of teaching medical ethics. 6.15 pm Westminster Hospital
Martin Brueton, Senior Lecturer in Paediatrics, Westminster Medical School

R B Welbourn, Emeritus Professor of Surgical Endocrinology, Royal Postgraduate Medical School

G R Dunstan, formerly Professor of Moral and Social Theology, King's College London

Ian Kennedy, Reader in the Faculty of Laws, KCL

Wednesday 11 May

Sheffield Medical Group Symposium: THE MEDICAL AND SOCIAL CONSEQUENCES OF UNEMPLOYMENT. 8.00 pm Lecture Theatre E, Sheffield Medical School

How has large scale unemployment affected the health of our population? What are the effects of it on the family and the individual? How might meaningful living without employment be promoted?

Thursday 12 May

Oxford Medical Forum meeting: THE NATURE OF CONSCIOUSNESS. 8.30 pm Green College, Seminar Room, Woodstock Road

Dr Freda Newcombe, Head of Department of Neuropsychology, Oxford University

J Glover, Tutor in Philosophy, Oxford University

Professor C Blakemore, Professor of Physiology, Oxford University

Tuesday 17 May

EMG symposium: EUTHANASIA? 5.15 pm Seminar Room, 1st floor, Department of Biochemistry, Hugh Robson Building

Speakers will include:

Dr Raanan Gillon, Editor, Journal of Medical Ethics

Tuesday 7 June

EMG symposium: IS ECT JUSTIFIED? 5.15 pm Seminar Room, 1st Floor, Department of Biochemistry, Hugh Robson Building

Dr Larry Gostin, Legal Director, MIND

Professor A T Altschul, Department of Nursing Studies, University of Edinburgh

Professor R E Kendell, Department of Psychiatry, Royal Edinburgh Hospital

Thursday 16 June

SMG symposium: OBSTETRICS: TIME FOR A NEW APPROACH? 8.00 pm Lecture Theatre E, Sheffield Medical School

A look at the arguments for and against natural childbirth, questioning present obstetric methods (eg episiotomies, use of pain-killers, the clinical atmosphere of hospital delivery) and discussing whether emphasis should always be on maximum safety.

Medical groups

Information on Medical Groups

Further details and complete lecture lists are available from the secretaries of the medical groups listed below. Please enclose a stamped addressed A4 envelope.

ABERDEEN MEDICAL GROUP

Mrs Elaine Foreman, Clinical Research Centre, Cornhill Road, Aberdeen AB9 22H

Dr Charles Crichton, c/o The Aberdeen Medical Group, Medical Buildings, Foresterhill, Aberdeen AB9 2ZO

BIRMINGHAM MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Anthony Parsons, Department of Obstetrics, Birmingham Maternity Hospital, Edgbaston. Birmingham B15

BRISTOL MEDICAL GROUP

Sarah Bruml, 101 Kingsdown Parade, Cotham, Bristol BS6
Steven Webber, 21 Hampton Park, Redland, Bristol BS6

CAMBRIDGE MEDICAL GROUP

Mr Patrick Doyle, Department of Urology, Addenbrooke's Hospital, Hill's Road, Cambridge

CARDIFF MEDICAL GROUP

Patrick Coyle, 20 Long Oaks Court, Sketty, Swansea SA2 0QH

Paul Armitage, Department of Nursing Studies, Welsh National School of Medicine, Cardiff

DUNDEE MEDICAL GROUP

c/o Ivan Hanna,
15 Wimberley Houses,
Glamis Drive, Dundee

EDINBURGH MEDICAL GROUP

Philip Cochia, Department of Chest Diseases, Northern General Hospital, Ferry Road, Edinburgh EH5 2DQ

GLASGOW MEDICAL GROUP

Mr Sam Galbraith, Institute of Neurological Sciences, Southern General Hospital, Glasgow

LEEDS MEDICAL GROUP

Stephen Singleton, Department of Medicine, Leeds General Infirmary, Leeds
Robert Wright, Charge Nurse, Accident and Emergency Unit, Leeds, General Infirmary, Leeds

LEICESTER MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Liam Donaldson, Department of Community Health, Clinical Sciences Building, Leicester Royal Infirmary, PO Box 65, Leicester LE2 7LX

LIVERPOOL MEDICAL GROUP

Roger Cudmore, Royal Liverpool Children's Hospital, Myrtle Street, Liverpool

LONDON MEDICAL GROUP

Director of Studies, Edward Shotter, Room 68 Tavistock House North, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9LG

MANCHESTER MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Mary Lobjoit, Student Health Centre, Crawford House, Precinct Centre, Oxford Road, Manchester M13 9QS

NEWCASTLE MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Christopher Drinkwater, 14 Belle Grove Terrace, Newcastle-upon-Tyne NE2 4LL

OXFORD MEDICAL FORUM

Dr Tony Hope,
12 Guy Court, King Street,
Oxford, OX2 6DB

SHEFFIELD MEDICAL GROUP

Tony Avery, Medical Society Office, Sheffield Medical School, Beech Hill Road, Sheffield S10 2RX

SOUTHAMPTON MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Barbara Leppard, Department of Dermatology, Graham Road, Royal South Hants Hospital, Southampton

**Is brain death a proper re-definition of death?
Philosopher says no, neurologist says yes**

Alister Browne with a commentary by C Pallis

**Medical paternalism is defended – ‘to maximise
patients’ autonomy’**

Mark S Komrad

Medical ethics: ‘an intensely practical subject’

Alan G Johnson

**The Arthur case: BMA Secretary rejects
lawyers’ proposed legislation**

*Diana and Malcolm Brahams, Peter Ferguson, with
a commentary by John Havard*

Plus: The ethics of resource allocation * Medical ethics education: a professor of religion investigates * Editorials: Medicine and moral philosophy; On paternalism and autonomy * Case conference: Cutting the thread and pulling the wool – a request for euthanasia in general practice * Book reviews * Letters * Lectures and symposia * Medical groups