

# The Journal of the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

The *Journal of Medical Ethics* was established in 1975, with a multi-disciplinary Editorial Board, to promote the study of contemporary medico-moral problems. The Editorial Board has as its aims the encouragement of a high academic standard for this developing subject and the influencing of the quality of both professional and public discussion. The *Journal* is published quarterly. The *Journal* includes papers on all aspects of medical ethics, analyses ethical concepts and theories and features case conferences and comment on clinical practice. It includes book reviews and details of lectures and symposia on issues raised by the practice of medicine.

## Editorial Board

### EDITOR:

*Raanan Gillon*, BA (Philosophy), MB, BS, MRCP, Assistant Director, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics; Director, Imperial College Health Service, University of London.

### CONSULTING EDITORS:

*Sir Douglas Black*, President, Royal College of Physicians.  
*D W Hamlyn*, Professor of Philosophy, Birkbeck College, University of London and Editor of *Mind*.

### EDITORIAL BOARD:

*Thomas Oppé*, Chairman, Professor of Paediatrics, St Mary's Hospital Medical School, London.

*K M Boyd*, Scottish Director, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics.

*Alastair Campbell*, Senior Lecturer, Department of Christian Ethics and Practical Theology, Edinburgh.

*A W Clare*, Senior Lecturer, Institute of Psychiatry, University of London.

*Robin Downie*, Professor of Moral Philosophy, Glasgow.

*A S Duncan*, Emeritus Professor of Medical Education, University of Edinburgh.

*C M Fletcher*, Emeritus Professor of Clinical Epidemiology, University of London.

*Michael F Green*, Consultant Physician, The Royal Free Hospital, London.

*R M Hare*, White's Professor of Moral Philosophy and Fellow of Corpus Christi College, Oxford.

*Roger Higgs*, General Practitioner, London.

*Gerard J Hughes, SJ*, Department of Philosophy, Heythrop College, London.

*Peter Huntingford*, Consultant, Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Kingston General Hospital.

*Margot Jeffreys*, Professor of Medical Sociology, Bedford College, London.

*Ian Kennedy*, Reader in Law, King's College, London.

*Raymond Plant*, Professor of Politics, Southampton.

*Sir Desmond Pond*, Professor of Psychiatry, The London Hospital Medical College, London.

*Sir Martin Roth*, Professor of Psychiatry, Cambridge.

*Robert Sells*, Director, Renal Transplant Unit, Liverpool Royal Infirmary, Liverpool.

*Rt Hon Lord Justice Shaw*, Lord Justice of Appeal.

*Gerald Stern*, Consultant Neurologist, University College Hospital, London.

*R B Welbourn*, Professor of Surgical Endocrinology, Royal Postgraduate Medical School, London.

*Eric Wilkes*, Professor of Community Care and General Practice, University of Sheffield.

*Bernard Williams*, Provost, King's College, Cambridge.

*Edward Shoter*, Director of Studies, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics, *ex officio*.

### TECHNICAL EDITOR:

*Ann Lloyd*, London.

ISSN 0306-6800

Copyright © 1982 *Journal of medical ethics*. All Rights Reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the *Journal of medical ethics*.

## Submitting manuscripts for publication

Papers submitted for publication should be sent in triplicate to: The Editor, *Journal of medical ethics*, Tavistock House North, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9LG. Rejected manuscripts are not returned unless accompanied by a stamped addressed envelope, or international reply coupon. Papers should be in double-spaced typewriting on one side of the paper only. The corresponding author's name and address should appear on the first page. Authors should also submit an *interesting* abstract with their papers. On a separate sheet a brief entry for 'Contributors to this issue' should be supplied, containing the title of the author's present post, degrees and/or professional qualifications, and any other relevant information. Abbreviations should be avoided except for those in general use. The names of journals, organisations etc., should be given in full.

As from the beginning of Volume 7 (March 1981) *JME* has adopted a simplified 'Vancouver style' for references: details are given in *JME*, December 1980, p 214 and in *JME*, March 1982, p 56. They are also available from the editorial office. As the 'Vancouver style' is incompatible with the long established style of references for legal articles, lawyers should use their own standard style, but avoid abbreviations so as to facilitate reference by others. The *Journal* is multidisciplinary and papers should be in clear English, accessible to any intelligent reader.

Four copies of the *Journal* will be sent to authors free of charge after their papers are published. Offprints of individual papers may be bought from The Publisher, *Journal of medical ethics*, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

## Notice to subscribers

The *Journal of medical ethics* is published quarterly. The annual subscription rates are £19.00 in the United Kingdom and Irish Republic, and US \$48.00 in all countries overseas. Payment for overseas subscriptions should be made in dollars, *ie*, US \$48.00, or in your national currency based on the prevailing exchange rate to the US dollar of that currency, payable to Professional and Scientific Publications/*JME A/c*. Orders can also be placed locally with any leading subscription agent or bookseller. (For the convenience of readers in the USA subscription orders, with or without payment, can also be sent to: Professional and Scientific Publications, 1172 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Mass. 02134. All enquiries, however, must be addressed to the Publisher in London). All enquiries regarding Air Mail rates, single copies, advertisements, etc. should be sent to: The Publisher, *Journal of medical ethics*, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

### Thematic review and index

The thematic review of past issues appears in the June issue each year and an index to each volume appears in the December issue.

Equally, nothing should be imposed against the patient's will: individuals must be free to decline information, whether trivial or important. The fine balance which this implies, where honestly conveyed information is freely available but not imposed, requires skill to maintain. And skill is the hallmark of a true professional.

## References

- (1) Hinton J. Whom do dying patients tell? *British medical journal* 1980; 281: 1328.
- (2) Text of the American Medical Association's new principles of medical ethics. *American medical news* 1980; Aug 1-8.

---

## Contributors to this issue

**J D Swales** is Professor of Medicine and Head of the Department of Medicine in the University of Leicester Medical School. He is also Editor of the journal *Clinical Science*.

**Andrew Smith** is a family doctor and part-time lecturer in Family Medicine at the University of Newcastle upon Tyne.

**John D Arras** is Member, Department of Social Medicine, Philosopher-in-Residence, Montefiore Medical Center, New York. He has a PhD in philosophy.

**Thomas H Murray** is Associate for Social and Behavioural Studies at the Hastings Center, Hastings-on-Hudson, New York. He has a PhD in psychology.

**Lawrence Goldie** is a consultant psychiatrist and also a psychoanalyst. He describes his position at the Royal Marsden Hospital as Consultant Medical Psychotherapist to distinguish what he does from what people expect when they hear the word 'psychiatrist'.

**Huw W S Francis** is a community physician and was Area Medical Officer for Camden and Islington Area Health Authority (Teaching).

**T A H English** is Consultant Cardiothoracic Surgeon to Papworth and Addenbrooke's Hospitals and is Director of the British Heart Foundation Heart Transplant Research Unit at Papworth Hospital.

**Lady McCarthy** is a Visiting Fellow of the King's Fund College and was formerly chairman of Oxfordshire Area Health Authority.

**Gillian Matthews** is a specialist in Community Medicine (Health Care Planning) and as such is involved in providing medical input into the multi-disciplinary process of strategic planning for the South East Thames Regional Health Authority.

*Case conference editor*

Roger Higgs, 81 Brixton Water Lane, London SW2 1PH

*American Correspondent*

Bernard Towers, Department of Pediatrics, University of California at Los Angeles.

---

---

# Lectures and symposia

---

Readers are asked to check with their local medical group secretaries for further details. The addresses are on page 167 of this issue

## Tuesday 5 October

LMG symposium: WHOSE BABY IS IT ANYWAY?: The ethics of unnatural creation. 6.00 pm Charing Cross Hospital, Fulham

Dr Hugh Jolly, Consultant Paediatrician, Charing Cross Hospital  
Professor I L Craft, Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, The Royal Free Hospital

Dr Robert Snowden, Senior Lecturer in Sociology and Director of the Family Planning Research Unit, Exeter University

Professor Keith Ward, Professor of Moral and Social Theology, King's College, London

## Thursday 7 October

LMG symposium: THE HOSPITALISATION OF DEATH: Should more people die at home? 5.45 pm Guy's Hospital

Professor J S Cameron, Professor of Renal Medicine, Guy's Hospital Medical School

Dr P F E Brown, General Practitioner

Dr Ann Bowling, Research Officer, National Children's Bureau and joint author of *Life After a Death: a Study of the Elderly Widowed*.

Dr Nell O'Connor, Medical Officer, Trinity Hospice

## Tuesday 12 October

LMG symposium: BREAKDOWN: Fact or fantasy? 5.45 pm King's College Hospital

Mr L T Cotton, Dean, King's College Hospital Medical School

Dr Anthony Clare, Senior Lecturer and Consultant Psychiatrist, Institute of Psychiatry

Professor N S Sutherland, Professor of Experimental Psychology, Sussex University

## Thursday 14 October

LMG symposium: THE RETURN OF THE VILLAGE IDIOT: A consequence of an enlightened Mental Health Act 5.45 pm The London Hospital

Dr S N Wolkind, Senior Lecturer in Clinical Psychiatry, The London Hospital Medical College

Dr J A Corbett, Physician, Bethlem Royal Hospital

Dr James MacKeith, Consultant Psychiatrist, Institute of Psychiatry  
Mr Peter Sedgwick, Lecturer in Politics, Leeds University

## Tuesday 19 October

LMG symposium: LIFE AND DEATH DECISIONS: Should the moral view of the patient or the doctor prevail? 5.45 pm Middlesex Hospital Medical School

Dr D Macdiarmid, Senior Lecturer in Psychotherapy, Middlesex Hospital  
Professor Ian McColl, Professor of Surgery, Guy's Hospital

Professor R M Hare, White's Professor of Moral Philosophy, Oxford  
Sir Immanuel Jakobovits, The Chief Rabbi

## Thursday 21 October

LMG symposium: THE ETHICS OF NUCLEAR WEAPONS: 5.45 pm Royal Free Hospital, Hampstead

Dr Michael Green, Consultant Physician, Department of Geriatric Medicine, Royal Free Hospital

Dr Andrew Haines, Senior Lecturer in General Practice, Middlesex Hospital Medical School

General Sir Hugh Beach, Director, St George's House, Windsor

## Tuesday 26 October

LMG symposium: SEVERE DEPRESSION: Is consent to ECT really possible? 5.45 pm St Bartholomew's Hospital

Professor W Linford Rees, Emeritus Professor of Psychiatry, University of London

Dr Pamela Taylor, Senior Lecturer in Forensic Psychiatry, Institute of Psychiatry

Dr Larry Gostin, Legal Director, MIND

It is hoped to present a patient

## Thursday 28 October

LMG symposium: BREAST CANCER: Do surgeons understand how a woman feels? 6 pm St George's Hospital, Tooting

Professor Bryan Brooke, Emeritus Professor of Surgery, St George's Hospital Medical School  
Professor M Baum, Professor of Surgery, King's College Hospital Medical School

Mrs Carolyn Faulder, journalist and author of *Breast Cancer: a Guide to its Early Detection and Treatment*

Mrs Betty Westgate, Founder and President of the Mastectomy Association

## Tuesday 2 November

LMG symposium: THE GOOD DOCTOR AND THE BAD PROGNOSIS: the many sides of clinical truth 5.45 pm St Mary's Hospital

Professor W S Peart, Director of the Medical Unit, St Mary's Hospital  
Professor John Hinton, Professor of Psychiatry, Middlesex Hospital Medical School

Dr Averil Stedeford, Senior Registrar, Department of Psychotherapy, The Warneford Hospital, Oxford

Dr Mary Catterall, Consultant Radiotherapist, Hammersmith Hospital

#### Thursday 4 November

LMG symposium: SEVERELY HANDICAPPED INFANTS: The law and clinical judgment 5.45 pm St Thomas's Hospital  
Dr G S Clayden, Senior Lecturer, Department of Paediatrics, St Thomas's Hospital Medical School  
Professor A G M Campbell, Professor of Child Health, Aberdeen University  
Dr Margaret Puxon, Barrister-at-Law  
Mr David Plank, Director of Social Services for the London Borough of Hammersmith and Fulham

#### Tuesday 9 November

LMG symposium: DOING WHAT COMES NATURALLY: Shouldn't women choose the method of birth? 5.45 pm University College Hospital  
Professor Herbert Brant, Professor of Clinical Obstetrics and Gynaecology, University College Hospital  
Professor Stuart Campbell, Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, King's College Hospital Medical School  
Dr Christopher Hindley, GP Obstetrician  
Mrs Frances Cairncross, Women's Editor, *The Guardian*

#### Thursday 11 November

LMG lecture: THE NATURE AND MANAGEMENT OF TERMINAL PAIN: 6.15 pm Westminster Hospital  
Dame Cicely Saunders, Medical Director, St Christopher's Hospice

#### Tuesday 16 November

LMG symposium: POLITICAL ABUSE OF PSYCHIATRY: at home and abroad 6.00 pm Charing Cross Hospital, Fulham  
Mr J E H Pendower, Consultant Surgeon, Charing Cross Hospital  
Dr Sidney Bloch, Honorary Lecturer in Psychiatry and Consultant Psychiatrist, Warneford Hospital and University of Oxford  
Mr Louis J Blom-Cooper, Joint Director of the Legal Research Unit, Bedford College

#### Thursday 18 November

LMG SYMPOSIUM: SEX AND SEX ABILITY: The role of women in medicine and men in midwifery 5.45 pm Guy's Hospital  
Robert Knight, Consultant Physician, Guy's Hospital  
Dr Berry Beaumont, Specialist in Community Medicine, Islington District Health Authority  
Mr Tony Shepherd, nurse counsellor, The London Hospital  
Miss Jean Aitken-Swan, joint author of *Male Midwives: a Report of Two Studies*

#### Tuesday 23 November

LMG symposium: OBESITY: Disease or deviance? 5.45 pm King's College Hospital  
Professor J Anderson, Professor of Medicine, King's College Hospital Medical School  
Professor A H Crisp, Professor of Psychiatry, St George's Hospital  
Dr John Garrow, Consultant Physician, Clinical Research Centre, Northwick Park  
Mr Jonathan Benthall, Director, Royal Anthropological Institute

#### Thursday 25 November

LMG symposium: DEALING WITH SEXUAL PROBLEMS: Why are doctors so bad at it? 5.45 pm The London Hospital  
Dr Sidney Crown, Consultant Psychiatrist, The London Hospital  
Dr Elizabeth Stanley, Lecturer in Sexuality, St George's Hospital  
Dr Michael Courtenay, Senior Research Fellow, General Practice Vocational Training Scheme, St Thomas's Hospital  
Mrs Marjorie Proops, *Daily Mirror* columnist

#### Tuesday 30 November

LMG symposium: THE QUEST FOR A PERFECT BABY: the consequences of ante-natal diagnosis 5.45 pm Middlesex Hospital Medical School  
Dr R J K Brown, Consultant Paediatrician, Middlesex Hospital

Professor R W Taylor, Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, St Thomas's Hospital  
Professor R Williamson, Professor of Biochemistry, St Mary's Hospital  
Dr Wendy Farrant, Senior Research Officer, Department of Health and Welfare Education, University of London Institute of Education

#### Thursday 2 December

LMG symposium: DOES MEDICAL RESEARCH CONTRIBUTE TO HEALTH? 5.45 pm Royal Free Hospital, Hampstead  
Dr Bruce MacGillivray, The Dean, Royal Free Hospital School of Medicine  
Sir Douglas Black, President of the Royal College of Physicians  
Dr P O Williams, Director, The Wellcome Institute  
Mrs Lesley Doyal, Senior Lecturer in Sociology, Polytechnic of North London

#### Tuesday 7 December

LMG symposium: SEXUAL ABUSE OF CHILDREN.: Is our response more damaging than the relationship? 5.45 pm St Bartholomew's Hospital  
Dr P J N Cox, Consultant Paediatrician, St Bartholomew's Hospital  
Dr Arnon Bentovim, Consultant Psychiatrist, Great Ormond Street  
Mr Paul Griffiths, unit leader of NSPCC Special Unit and Family Centre, Northants  
The Honourable Mr Justice Leonard

#### Thursday 9 December

LMG symposium: UNEMPLOYMENT OR UNDER-EMPLOYMENT?: the medical and social consequences of fewer jobs  
Dr N W Oakley, Consultant Physician, St George's Hospital  
Dr Roger Higgs, Director of General Practice Studies, King's College Hospital Medical School  
Dr Rachel Jenkins, Clinical Lecturer, Institute of Psychiatry  
Mr Jeremy Seabrook, author

## Medical groups

---

### **Information on Medical Groups**

Further details and complete lecture lists are available from the secretaries of the medical groups listed below. Please enclose a stamped addressed A4 envelope.

#### **ABERDEEN MEDICAL GROUP**

Mrs Elaine Foreman, 277 Clifton Road, Aberdeen

#### **BIRMINGHAM MEDICAL GROUP**

Dr Anthony Parsons, Department of Obstetrics, Birmingham Maternity Hospital, Edgbaston. Birmingham B15

#### **BRISTOL MEDICAL GROUP**

Sarah Bruml, 101 Kingsdown Parade, Cotham, Bristol BS6  
Steven Webber, 21 Hampton Park, Redland, Bristol BS6

#### **CAMBRIDGE MEDICAL GROUP**

Mr Patrick Doyle, Department of Urology, Addenbrooke's Hospital, Hill's Road, Cambridge

#### **CARDIFF MEDICAL GROUP**

Patrick Coyle, Cardiff Royal Infirmary, Newport Road, Cardiff

Paul Armitage, Department of Nursing Studies, Welsh National School of Medicine, Cardiff

#### **DUNDEE MEDICAL GROUP**

Dr Douglas Shaw, Consultant Geriatrician, Royal Victoria Hospital, Dundee

#### **EDINBURGH MEDICAL GROUP**

Dr Brian Potter, EMG Project Office, 24 Buccleuch Place, Edinburgh EH8 9LN

#### **GLASGOW MEDICAL GROUP**

Mr Sam Galbraith, Institute of Neurological Sciences, Southern General Hospital, Glasgow

#### **LEICESTER MEDICAL GROUP**

Dr Liam Donaldson, Department of Community Health, Clinical Sciences Building, Leicester Royal Infirmary, PO Box 65, Leicester LE2 7LX

#### **LIVERPOOL MEDICAL GROUP**

Roger Cudmore, Royal Liverpool Children's Hospital, Myrtle Street, Liverpool

#### **LONDON MEDICAL GROUP**

Director of Studies, Edward Shotter, Room 68 Tavistock House North, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9LG

#### **MANCHESTER MEDICAL GROUP**

Dr Mary Lobjoit, Teaching Unit 4, University Hospital of South Manchester, Nell Lane, West Didsbury, Manchester M20 8LR

#### **NEWCASTLE MEDICAL GROUP**

Dr Christopher Drinkwater, 14 Belle Grove Terrace, Newcastle-upon-Tyne NE2 4LL

#### **OXFORD MEDICAL FORUM**

C/o Miss Mary Timbrell, Manor House, (OAHA) off Headley Way, Headington, Oxford OX3 9DZ

#### **SHEFFIELD MEDICAL GROUP**

Dr Martin Hayes-Allen, 183 Whitham Road, Broomhill, Sheffield S10 2SB

#### **SOUTHAMPTON MEDICAL GROUP**

Dr Barbara Leppard, Department of Dermatology, Graham Road, Royal South Hants Hospital, Southampton

---

## Notice for contributors to the Journal of medical ethics

---

### Simplified 'Vancouver style'

All papers submitted for publication in Volume 7 and following issues should contain the following:

- 1 On page one of the manuscript there should be:
  - a) the title of the article which should be concise but informative
  - b) names, initials and academic degrees of author or authors
  - c) names of department(s) and institution(s) to which the work should be attributed, if any
  - d) disclaimers, if any
  - e) source(s) of support, if any
- 2 On page two there should be:
  - a) an *interesting* abstract or summary of not more than 150 words. Emphasise important and/or new aspects of the article and attract the potential reader.
  - b) key (indexing) terms – below the abstract, provide and identify as such, three to ten keywords or short phrases that will assist indexers in cross-indexing your article and that may be published with the abstract. Where appropriate, use terms from the Medical Subject Headings List from *Index Medicus*.
- 3 Acknowledgments; Acknowledge only persons who have made substantive contributions to the study. Authors are responsible for obtaining written permission from everyone acknowledged by name because readers may infer their endorsement of data and conclusions.
- 4 References: Number these consecutively in the order in which they are first mentioned in the text, tables, and captions, by arabic numerals (in parenthesis). The list of references at the end of the paper should be numbered in the order in which each reference appears in the text. Try to

avoid using abstracts as references; 'unpublished observations' and 'personal communications' may not be used as references, although references to written, not verbal, communications may be inserted (in parenthesis) in the text. Manuscripts accepted but not yet published may be used as references – designate the journal followed by 'in press' (in parenthesis). Information from manuscripts submitted but not accepted should be cited in the text as 'unpublished observations' (in parenthesis).

*References must be verified by the author(s) against the original documents.*

The following scheme, a simplification of the 'Vancouver style' for biomedical journals, should be followed for each reference: in the text – number (in parenthesis); in the list – author (list all authors if six or less; if seven or more, list only the first three and add '*et al*'), title, name of publication if different from title; publisher (where appropriate); year of publication; and, where appropriate, volume, number and page references of article or chapter referred to. Examples of correct forms of reference are given below.

- a) Standard journal article:
  - (1) Paul E F, Paul J. Self-ownership, abortion and infanticide. *Journal of medical ethics* 1979; 5: 133–138.
  - b) Corporate author:
    - (2) Conference of Royal Colleges and Faculties of the United Kingdom. Diagnosis of brain death. *Lancet* 1976; ii: 1060–1070.
  - c) Personal author:
    - (3) Hick J. Death and eternal life. Glasgow and London: Collins, 1976

- d) Corporate author:
  - (4) Central Statistical Office, Social trends, No. 9. London: HMSO, 1979.
- e) Editor, compiler, chairman as author:
  - (5) Phillips C E, Wolfe J N, eds. Clinical practice and economics. Tunbridge Wells: Pitman Medical, 1977.
- f) Chapter in book:
  - (6) Armstrong C N. Intersexuality in man. In: Armstrong C N, Marshall A J, eds. Intersexuality in vertebrates including man. London: Academic Press, 1964: 349–352.
- g) Agency publication:
  - (7) The Linacre Centre for the Study of Ethics and Health Care. Paper 1: The principle of respect for human life. In: Prolongation of life. London: The Linacre Centre for the Study of Ethics and Health Care, 1978.
- h) Newspapers article:
  - (8) Dinwoodie R. Volunteers die as heart drug results baffle doctors. *The Scotsman* 1980 Sept 5: 11 (cols 1–6).
- i) Magazine article:
  - (9) James J. Homoeopathy – the treatment of like with like. *The Listener* 1980 Aug 21: 234–236.

Authors are asked to avoid footnotes wherever possible. Articles for the *Journal* should be between 1200 and 3000 words in length except book reviews which should be between 300 and 1200 words.

*Authors are reminded that the Journal is multidisciplinary: papers published in it should be in jargon-free English and clearly written so as to be accessible to any intelligent reader.*

This notice is supplementary to the standard information published in each issue of the *Journal*.

01  
J075I

## **Symposium: Is medical ethics 'too important for a separate place in the curriculum'?**

*JD Swales with commentaries by John D Arras, Thomas H Murray and Andrew Smith*

## **The price of medical excellence**

*T A H English with commentary by Lady McCarthy*

## **Telling cancer patients the truth**

*Lawrence Goldie*

## **Gossips, eavesdroppers and peeping toms: a defence of the right to privacy**

*Huw W S Francis*

**Plus: Words: The boundaries of clinical freedom \* Editorial: On telling dying patients the truth \* Case conference: Obstructed death revisited \* Book reviews \* News and notes \* Letters \* Lectures and symposia \* Medical groups**