

Journal of medical ethics

The Journal of the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

The *Journal of Medical Ethics* was established in 1975, with a multi-disciplinary Editorial Board, to promote the study of contemporary medico-moral problems. The Editorial Board has as its aims the encouragement of a high academic standard for this developing subject and the influencing of the quality of both professional and public discussion. The *Journal* is published quarterly.

The *Journal* includes papers on all aspects of medical ethics, analyses ethical concepts and theories and features case conferences and comment on clinical practice. It includes book reviews and details of lectures and symposia on issues raised by the practice of medicine.

Editor

Raanan Gillon, BA (Philosophy), MB, BS, MRCP, Assistant Director, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics; College doctor, Imperial College, University of London.

CONSULTING EDITORS

Sir Douglas Black, President, Royal College of Physicians.
D W Hamlyn, Professor of Philosophy, Birkbeck College, University of London and Editor of *Mind*.

EDITORIAL BOARD

R B Welbourn (Chairman), Professor of Surgical Endocrinology, Royal Postgraduate Medical School, London.
K M Boyd, Scottish Director, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics.

Alastair Campbell, Senior Lecturer, Department of Christian Ethics and Practical Theology, Edinburgh.

A W Clare, Senior Lecturer, Institute of Psychiatry, University of London.

Robin Downie, Professor of Moral Philosophy, Glasgow.
A S Duncan, Emeritus Professor of Medical Education, University of Edinburgh.

G R Dunstan, Professor of Moral and Social Theology, King's College, London.

C M Fletcher, Emeritus Professor of Clinical Epidemiology, University of London.

Michael F Green, Consultant Physician, The Royal Free Hospital, London.

R M Hare, White's Professor of Moral Philosophy and Fellow of Corpus Christi College, Oxford.

Roger Higgs, General Practitioner, London.

Gerard J Hughes, SF, Department of Philosophy, Heythrop College, London.

Peter Huntingford, Consultant, Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Kingston General Hospital.

Margot Jeffreys, Professor of Medical Sociology, Bedford College, London.

Ian Kennedy, Reader in Law, King's College, London.

Thomas Oppé, Professor of Paediatrics, St Mary's Hospital Medical School, London.

Raymond Plant, Professor of Politics, Southampton.

Sir Desmond Pond, Professor of Psychiatry, The London Hospital Medical College, London.

Sir Martin Roth, Professor of Psychiatry, Cambridge.

Robert Sells, Director, Renal Transplant Unit, Liverpool Royal Infirmary, Liverpool.

Rt Hon Lord Justice Shaw, Lord Justice of Appeal.

Gerald Stern, Consultant Neurologist, University College Hospital, London.

Eric Wilkes, Professor of Community Care and General Practice, University of Sheffield.

Bernard Williams, Provost, King's College, Cambridge.

Edward Shotton, Director of Studies, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics, *ex officio*.

TECHNICAL EDITOR:

Dorothy Mitchell Smith, Edinburgh.

Contents

Editorial

Clinical research on children 3

Focus

Medical ethics and child psychiatry
Dora Black and Fiona Subotsky 5

UNIV. OF CONN.

Confidentiality: the confusion continues
D J Kenny 9

Changing practice on confidentiality:
a cause for concern

Derek P H Pheby 12

Commentary 1: *J M Jacob* 18

Commentary 2: *Michael Green* 21

Professional ethics - for whose benefit?
Paul Sieghart 25

Selection of patients
H J J Leenen 33

Five ethical doctrines for medical education
W T Tweel 37

Debate

Reply to Lorber, Cusine and Anscombe
John Harris 40

Words

Illegitimacy
Jenny Teichman 42

Letter from Germany

Michael H Kottow 44

Case conference

Truth at the last - a case of
obstructed death?
Roger Higgs 48

Book reviews 51

News and notes 53

Lectures and symposia 54

Medical groups 55

Correspondence 55

Notice for contributors 56

HEALTH CENTER LIBRARY

Submitting manuscripts for publication

Papers submitted for publication should be sent in triplicate to: The Editor, *Journal of medical ethics*, Tavistock House North, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9LG. Rejected manuscripts are not returned unless accompanied by a stamped addressed envelope, or international reply coupon. Papers should be in double-spaced typewriting on one side of the paper only. The corresponding author's name and address should appear on the first page. Authors should also submit an *interesting* abstract with their papers. On a separate sheet a brief entry for 'Contributors to this issue' should be supplied, containing the title of the author's present post, degrees and/or professional qualifications, and any other relevant information. Abbreviations should be avoided except for those in general use. The names of journals, organisations etc., should be given in full.

As from the beginning of Volume 7 (March 1981) *JME* has adopted a simplified 'Vancouver style' for references: details are given in *JME*, December 1980, p 214 and this issue on p 56. They are also available from the editorial office. As the 'Vancouver style' is incompatible with the long established style of references for legal articles, lawyers should use their own standard style, but avoid abbreviations so as to facilitate reference by others. The *Journal* is multidisciplinary and papers should be in clear English, accessible to any intelligent reader.

Four copies of the *Journal* will be sent to authors free of charge after their papers are published. Offprints of individual papers may be bought from The Publisher, *Journal of medical ethics*, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

Notice to subscribers

The *Journal of medical ethics* is published quarterly. The annual subscription rates are £19.00 in the United Kingdom and Irish Republic, and US \$48.00 in all countries overseas. Payment for overseas subscriptions should be made in dollars, *ie*, US \$48.00, or in your national currency based on the prevailing exchange rate to the US dollar of that currency, payable to Professional and Scientific Publications/*JME* A/c. Orders can also be placed locally with any leading subscription agent or bookseller. (For the convenience of readers in the USA subscription orders, with or without payment, can also be sent to: Professional and Scientific Publications, 1172 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Mass. 02134. All enquiries, however, must be addressed to the Publisher in London). All enquiries regarding Air Mail rates, single copies, advertisements, etc. should be sent to: The Publisher, *Journal of medical ethics*, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

ISSN 0306-6800

Copyright © 1982 *Journal of medical ethics*. All Rights Reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the *Journal of medical ethics*.

Dora Black is Consultant Child Psychiatrist, Edgware General Hospital and Honorary Consultant, Hospital for Sick Children, Gt Ormond Street, London.

Michael F Green is Consultant Physician, Department of Geriatric Medicine, Royal Free and New End Hospitals, London

John Harris is Lecturer in Philosophy in the Department of Education, University of Manchester

J M Jacob is Lecturer in Law, London School of Economics and Political Science, University of London.

D J Kenny is an administrator for the North West Thames Regional Health Authority.

Michael H Kottow is Deputy Chief Ophthalmologist, Charlottenklinik für Augenranke, Stuttgart, West Germany

H J J Leenen is Professor of Social Medicine and Health Law, University of Amsterdam.

D F H Pheby is Registrar in Community Medicine, Wessex Regional Health Authority.

Paul Sieghart is a Barrister, Gray's Inn, London.

Fiona Subotsky is Consultant Child Psychiatrist, King's College Hospital, London and Brixton Child Guidance Unit; Honorary Consultant Bethlehem Royal and Maudsley Hospitals.

Jenny Teichman is Fellow in Philosophy at New Hall, Cambridge.

W T Tweel Jr is Assistant Professor, Department of Family Practice, Marshall University School of Medicine, Huntington, West Virginia, United States.

American correspondent

Bernard Towers, Department of Pediatrics, University of California at Los Angeles.

Case conference editor

Roger Higgs, 81 Brixton Water Lane, London SW2 1PH.

Thematic review and index

The thematic review of past issues appears in the June issue each year and an index to each volume appears in the December issue.

Lectures and symposia

Readers are asked to check with their local medical group secretaries for further details. The addresses are on page 55 of this issue.

Thursday 1 April

LMG symposium: *MEDIA MEDICINE*: No cooperation without control? 5.45 pm Royal Free Hospital, Hampstead

Neil McIntyre, Professor of medicine, Royal Free Hospital
Robert Sells, Director, Renal Transplant Unit, Liverpool Royal Infirmary

Karl Sabbagh, Director of the MSD Foundation; Television Producer. Extracts from recent medical TV programmes will be shown.

Tuesday 6 April

CMG symposium: *MEDICINE AND THE MEDIA*: Does public information do more harm than good?

Tuesday 20 April

LMG lecture: *MARRY EARLY AND MARRY OFTEN*: The causes of marital breakdown 5.45 pm St Bartholomew's Hospital, London
Jack Dominian, Consultant Psychiatrist, Central Middlesex Hospital

Thursday 22 April

BMG symposium: *THE ELDERLY EXPLOSION*: How will the Services cope?

Bernard Isaacs, Professor of Geriatrics, University of Birmingham

Michael Power, Senior Research Fellow, School of Applied Social Studies, University of Bristol

LMG illustrated symposium: *HEROIC TREATMENT*: Is death the final failure? 6.00 pm St George's Hospital, Tooting

R D Lowe, Dean St George's Hospital Medical School
Jack Tinker, Director, Intensive Therapy Unit, Middlesex Hospital
Sue Porter, Nursing officer, ITU, Middlesex Hospital

Tuesday 27 April

LMG illustrated symposium: *CULTURE AND COMMUNICATION*: Diagnostic implications of an immigrant population 5.45 pm St Mary's Hospital

Conrad Harris, Director, Department of General Practice, St Mary's Hospital Medical School
Kazi Islam
Julian Leff, Assistant Director, MRC Social Psychiatry Unit, Institute of Psychiatry
James Cameron, author and journalist

Thursday 29 April

LMG illustrated symposium: *THE ALCOHOLIC*: Someone who drinks more than his GP? 5.45 pm St Thomas's Hospital

R P H Thompson, Consultant Physician, St Thomas's Hospital
D L Davies, Medical Director, Newington Unit, Ticehurst House, Sussex
A Ward Gardner, Esso Medical Centre

Marcus Grant, Director, Alcohol Education Centre

Tuesday 4 May

LMG symposium: *PSYCHOSURGERY*: Do the risks outweigh the benefits? 5.45 pm University College Hospital

C G Clark, Professor of Surgery, University College Hospital
John R Bartlett, Consultant Neurosurgeon, Brook General Hospital

Anthony Whitehead, Consultant Psychiatrist, Bevendean Hospital, Brighton

Larry Gostin, Legal Director, MIND

Thursday 6 May

LMG illustrated symposium: *THE ETHICS OF CANCER TREATMENT*: 6.15 pm Westminster Hospital

A F Lant, Consultant Physician and Professor of Therapeutics, Westminster Medical School
R J Berry, Professor of Oncology, Middlesex Hospital Medical School
Raanan Gillon, Student Health physician, Imperial College; Editor, *Journal of medical ethics*

Steven Greer, Senior Lecturer and Consultant Psychiatrist, King's College Hospital

Tuesday 11 May

CMG lecture: *THE HUMAN GUINEA PIG*: Do patients have a say in research?

Mrs Jean Robinson, Patient's Association

R Marks, Professor of Dermatology, Heath Hospital

Tuesday 1 June

EMG symposium: *ABORTION*: 5.15 pm Meadows Lecture Theatre, Medical School, Teviot Place, Edinburgh

Revd Professor G Dunstan, Department of Moral and Social Theology, King's College, London

Brian T Potter, Secretary, Edinburgh Medical Group

Medical groups

Further information on Medical Groups

Further details and complete lecture lists are available from the secretaries of the medical groups listed below. Please enclose a stamped addressed A4 envelope.

ABERDEEN MEDICAL GROUP

Mrs Elaine Foreman, 277 Clifton Road, Aberdeen
Dr Andrew Fraser, 13 Erskine Street, Aberdeen

BIRMINGHAM MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Anthony Parsons, Department of Obstetrics, Birmingham Maternity Hospital, Edgbaston, Birmingham B15

BRISTOL MEDICAL GROUP

Sarah Bruml, 101 Kingsdown Parade, Cotham, Bristol BS6
Steven Webber, 21 Hampton Park, Redland, Bristol BS6

CAMBRIDGE MEDICAL GROUP

Mr Patrick Doyle, Department of Urology, Addenbrooke's Hospital, Hill's Road, Cambridge

CARDIFF MEDICAL GROUP

Miss Julie Forsey, 1A Heathwood Road, Birchgrove, Cardiff

DUNDEE MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Douglas Shaw, Consultant Geriatrician, Royal Victoria Hospital, Dundee

EDINBURGH MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Brian Potter, EMG Project Office, 24 Buccleuch Place, Edinburgh EH8 9LN

GLASGOW MEDICAL GROUP

Mr Sam Galbraith, Institute of Neurological Sciences, Southern General Hospital, Glasgow

LEICESTER MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Liam Donaldson, Department of Community Health, Clinical Sciences Building, Leicester Royal Infirmary, PO Box 65, Leicester LE2 7LX

LIVERPOOL MEDICAL GROUP

Roger Cudmore, Royal Liverpool Children's Hospital, Myrtle Street, Liverpool

LONDON MEDICAL GROUP

Director of Studies, Room 68 Tavistock House North, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9LG

MANCHESTER MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Mary Lobjoit, Teaching Unit 4, University Hospital of South Manchester, Nell Lane, West Didsbury, Manchester M20 8LR

NEWCASTLE MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Christopher Drinkwater, 14 Belle Grove Terrace, Newcastle-upon-Tyne NE2 4LL

OXFORD MEDICAL FORUM

C/o Miss Mary Timbrell, Manor House, (OAHA) off Headley Way, Headington, Oxford OX3 9DZ

SHEFFIELD MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Martin Hayes-Allen, 183 Whitham Road, Broomhill, Sheffield S10 2SB

SOUTHAMPTON MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Barbara Leppard, Department of Dermatology, Graham Road, Royal South Hants Hospital, Southampton

Correspondence

The Reith Lectures

SIR

Most of your December issue relating to Ian Kennedy's Reith Lectures, was a discussion of the patient-doctor relationship, by a mixed medical group with the 1980 Reith Lecturer, a lawyer.

There was mention neither of kindness nor of compassion.

Another lawyer seeking to clarify 'love your neighbour as yourself' asked Jesus 'Who is my neighbour?'

The sequel, we all know, was the parable of the good Samaritan. Asked by Jesus 'Which of these three do you think was neighbour to the man who fell into the hands of robbers?', the lawyer answered 'The one who showed him kindness'. Jesus said 'Go and do as he did'. (1).

Reference

- (1) New English Bible. Luke 10 vv 25-37.

REVD WALTER HEDGCOCK
MD, FRCGP
*Adviser to Bishop of Norwich
on Scientific Responsibilities
Fairstead Cottage
Cley Holt
Norfolk NR25 7RU*

Notice for contributors to the Journal of medical ethics

Simplified 'Vancouver style'

All papers submitted for publication in Volume 8 and following issues should contain the following:

- 1 On page one of the manuscript there should be:
 - a) the title of the article which should be concise but informative
 - b) names, initials and academic degrees of author or authors
 - c) names of department(s) and institution(s) to which the work should be attributed, if any
 - d) disclaimers, if any
 - e) source(s) of support, if any
- 2 On page two there should be:
 - a) an *interesting* abstract or summary of not more than 150 words. Emphasise important and/or new aspects of the article and attract the potential reader.
 - b) key (indexing) terms – below the abstracts, provide and identify as such, three to ten keywords or short phrases that will assist indexers in cross-indexing your article and that may be published with the abstract. Where appropriate, use terms from the Medical Subject Headings List from *Index Medicus*.
- 3 Acknowledgments:

Acknowledge only persons who have made substantive contributions to the study. Authors are responsible for obtaining written permission from everyone acknowledged by name because readers may infer their endorsement of data and conclusions.
- 4 References:

Number these consecutively in the order in which they are first mentioned in the text, tables, and captions, by arabic numerals (in parenthesis). The list of references at the end of the paper should be numbered in the order in which each reference

appears in the text. Try to avoid using abstracts as references; 'unpublished observations' and 'personal communications' may not be used as references, although references to written, not verbal, communications may be inserted (in parenthesis) in the text. Manuscripts accepted but not yet published may be used as references – designate the journal followed by 'in press' (in parenthesis). Information from manuscripts submitted but not accepted should be cited in the text as 'unpublished observations' (in parenthesis).

References must be verified by the author(s) against the original documents.

The following scheme, a simplification of the 'Vancouver style' for biomedical journals, should be followed for each reference: in the text – number (in parenthesis); in the list – author (list all authors if six or less; if seven or more, list only the first three and add '*et al*'); title, name of publication if different from title; publisher (where appropriate); year of publication; and, where appropriate, volume, number and page references of article or chapter referred to. Examples of correct forms of reference are given below.

- a) Standard journal article:
 - (1) Paul E F, Paul J. Self-ownership, abortion and infanticide. *Journal of medical ethics* 1979; 5: 133–138.
- b) Corporate author:
 - (2) Conference of Royal Colleges and Faculties of the United Kingdom. Diagnosis of brain death. *Lancet* 1976; ii: 1060–1070.
- c) Personal author:
 - (3) Hick J. Death and eternal life. Glasgow and London: Collins, 1976.
- d) Corporate author:

- (4) Central Statistical Office. Social trends, No 9. London: HMSO, 1979.
- e) Editor, compiler, chairman as author:
 - (5) Phillips C E, Wolfe J N, eds. Clinical practice and economics. Tunbridge Wells: Pitman Medical, 1977.
- f) Chapter in book:
 - (6) Armstrong C N. Intersexuality in man. In: Armstrong C N, Marshall A J, eds. Intersexuality in vertebrates including man. London: Academic Press, 1964: 349–352.
- g) Agency publication:
 - (7) The Linacre Centre for the Study of Ethics and Health Care. Paper 1: The principle of respect for human life. In: Prolongation of life. London: The Linacre Centre for the Study of Ethics and Health Care, 1978.
- h) Newspaper article:
 - (8) Dinwoodie R. Volunteers die as heart drug results baffle doctors. *The Scotsman* 1980 Sept 5: 11 (cols 1–6).
- i) Magazine article:
 - (9) James J. Homoeopathy – the treatment of like with like. *The Listener* 1980 Aug 21: 234–236.

Authors are asked to avoid footnotes wherever possible. Articles for the *Journal* should be between 1200 and 3000 words in length except book reviews which should be between 300 and 1200 words.

Authors are reminded that the Journal is multidisciplinary: papers published in it should be in jargon-free English and clearly written so as to be accessible to any intelligent reader.

This notice is supplementary to the standard information published in each issue of the *Journal*.

Journal of medical ethics

Contents

Editorial

Clinical research on children 3

Focus

Medical ethics and child psychiatry
Dora Black and Fiona Subotsky 5

Main articles

Confidentiality: the confusion continues
D J Kenny 9

Changing practice on confidentiality:
a cause for concern
Derek P H Pheby 12

Commentary 1: *J M Jacob* 18

Commentary 2: *Michael Green* 21

Professional ethics – for whose benefit?
Paul Sieghart 25

Selection of patients
H J J Leenen 33

Five ethical doctrines for medical education
W T Tweel 37

Debate

Reply to Lorber, Cusine and Anscombe
John Harris 40

Words

Illegitimacy
Jenny Teichman 42

Letter from Germany

Michael H Kottow 44

Case conference

Truth at the last – a case of
obstructed death?
Roger Higgs 48

Book reviews 51

News and notes 53

Lectures and symposia 54

Medical groups 55

Correspondence 55

Notice for contributors 56

In this issue:

INFANTICIDE vs LETTING DIE—THE CONTINUED DEBATE....
ETHICS AND CHILD PSYCHIATRY CONFIDENTIALITY—CONFUSION
AND CONCERN SELECTING PATIENTS FOR SCARCE TREATMENTS....
PROFESSIONAL ETHICS—FOR WHOSE BENEFIT?... TRUTH AND THE
CASE OF 'OBSTRUCTED DEATH'....