

# Journal of medical ethics

## The Journal of the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

### Editor

A V Campbell

### Consulting Editors

A S Duncan

C M Fletcher

### Editorial Board

R B Welbourn (Chairman)

Sir William Ferguson Anderson

Kenneth Boyd

R D Catterall

Sir John Donne

Robin Downie

G R Dunstan

Roger Higgs

Gerard Hughes

Ian Kennedy

Lord Kilbrandon

Marshall Marinker

Raymond Plant

Sir Martin Roth

Tony Smith

Margaret Stacey

Anthony Thorley

Eric Wilkes

Edward Shotter

### Technical Editor

Dorothy Mitchell Smith

## Contents

### Editorial

- 59 Psychiatry, ethics and political intimidation  
Case conference

### Focus

- 61 The 'no lose' philosophy in medicine  
*S Galbraith*

### Main articles

- 64 Incest  
*Mary Noble and J K Mason*  
Commentaries: *Gerard S Hughes SJ*  
*John Bancroft*
- 71 Declaration of Hawaii  
*Clarence D D Blomquist*
- 74 Political neutrality and international cooperation in medicine  
*Harold Merskey*
- 78 When consent is unbearable – a case report  
*Michael H Kottow*
- 81 Testing new drugs – the human volunteer  
*Duncan Vere*
- 84 Teaching medical ethics: University of Nijmegen, The Netherlands  
*Maurice A M De Wachter*

### Analysis

- 89 Mental disease  
*Antony Flew*

### Case conference

- 91 Lesbian couples: should help extend to AID?

### Report from America

- 96 The impact of the California Natural Death Act  
*Bernard Towers*

### The parliamentary scene

- 99 Abortion and pregnancy screening  
*Tony Smith*

- 100 Book reviews

- 104 News and notes

- 106 Correspondence

# Journal of medical ethics

The Society for the Study of Medical Ethics is an independent and non-partisan organization for the multidisciplinary study of issues raised by the practice of medicine. The *Journal of medical ethics* is published by the Society quarterly. It is addressed primarily to members of the medical and allied professions, but subscriptions are accepted from all those interested in medical ethics.

## Submitting manuscripts for publication

Papers submitted for publication should be sent in duplicate to Dr A V Campbell, the Editor, *Journal of medical ethics*, University of Edinburgh, New College, The Mound, Edinburgh EH1 2LX. They should be in double-spaced typewriting on one side of the paper only. On the paper the name of the author should appear with initials or distinguishing christian name and the address to which editorial communications should be sent.

Abbreviations should be avoided except for those in general use. The names of journals, organisations, etc, should be printed in full.

## References

In the list of references at the end of a paper each should be numbered in the order in which each reference appears in the text, and these numbers should be shown as superscripts in the text itself: thus, for example, in the text Bowden<sup>1</sup> and in the list <sup>1</sup>Bowden, Paul, *Journal of medical ethics* 1976, 2, 163-172. A reference to a book would also be indicated in the text by a number set above the line and quoted in the list by that number thus: <sup>1</sup>Abel-Smith, Brian, *Value for Money in Health Services*. Heinemann, London, 1976. However, exceptions will be made when references are quoted according to the common practice of a particular discipline, eg, the law, when to alter these would cause confusion to specialists likely to use the reference list.

Four copies of the journal will be sent to authors free of charge after their papers are published. Reprints of individual papers may be bought from The Publisher, *Journal of medical ethics*, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

## Notice to subscribers

The *Journal of medical ethics* is published quarterly. The annual subscription rates are £12.00 in the United Kingdom and Irish Republic, and US \$25.00 in all countries overseas. Payment for overseas subscriptions should be made in dollars, ie, US \$25.00, or in your national currency based on the prevailing exchange rate to the US dollar of that currency, payable to Professional and Scientific Publications/JME A/c. Orders can also be placed locally with any leading subscription agent or bookseller. (For the convenience of readers in the USA subscription orders, with or without payment, can also be sent to: Professional and Scientific Publications, 1172 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Mass. 02134. All enquiries, however, must be addressed to the Publisher in London.) All enquiries regarding Air Mail rates, single copies, advertisements, etc. should be sent to: The Publisher, *Journal of medical ethics*, Tavistock House North, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

# Contributors to this issue

**John Bancroft** is a clinical scientific officer at MRC Reproductive Biology Unit and honorary senior lecturer in the Department of Psychiatry at the University of Edinburgh.

**Clarence D D Blomquist** is assistant physician in charge and director of psychiatric studies and assistant professor of medical ethics at Karolinska Institute Medical School, Stockholm, Sweden.

**Maurice A M De Wachter** is a member of the medical faculty with particular responsibility for medical ethics, at the University of Nijmegen, The Netherlands.

**Antony Flew** Professor of Philosophy at Reading University.

**S Galbraith** is senior registrar in neurosurgery in the Institute of Neurological Sciences at the Southern General Hospital, Glasgow.

**Gerard J Hughes SJ** is a lecturer in philosophy at Heythrop College, London.

**Michael H Kottow** is Assistant Professor of Ophthalmology at the University of Illinois Medical Center, Chicago.

**J K Mason** is Professor of Forensic Medicine at the University of Edinburgh.

**Harold Merskey** is Professor of Psychiatry and Director of Psychiatric Education and Research at the Psychiatric Hospital, London, Ontario.

**Mary Noble** is a lecturer in the Department of Social Anthropology at the University of Edinburgh.

**Duncan Vere** is Professor of Pharmacology and Therapeutics at the London Hospital Medical College.

## American correspondent

Bernard Towers, *University of California*

## Case conference editor

Roger Higgs, 81 Brixton Water Lane, London SW2 1PH

Copyright © 1978 *Journal of medical ethics*. All Rights Reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the *Journal of medical ethics*.

## News and notes

### Southampton Medical Group

The inaugural symposium of the Southampton Medical Group was held on Tuesday 24 January at Southampton General Hospital. The subject was 'Media Medicine, Popularising or Falsifying?' Speakers were Karl Sabbagh, producer BBC Television (Science & Features); Oliver Gillie, Medical Correspondent of the Sunday Times; and Dr Tony Smith, Deputy Editor of the *British Medical Journal*.

Subsequent symposia deal with 'Is There Such a Thing as Mental Illness?', 'Abortion and the Medical Conscience', 'Intensive Care: Live or Let Die?' and 'Large is Beautiful? The District General Hospital and Health Care'.

There is a representative council made up of medical students, nurses, and members of allied professions of which John Dean, a fourth-year medical student is president. Secretary of the Representative Council is Josie Ribeiro an Occupational Therapist and Junior Treasurer is Peter Eckford, Staff Nurse, Royal Southampton Hospital. There is a multi-disciplinary consultative council to advise on the choice of speakers for the topics proposed by the student representative council of which the Chairman is Professor Michael Hall, Professor of Geriatric Medicine. The Co-ordinating Secretary is the Reverend Paul King and the Senior Treasurer is Dr Roger Buchanan, Consultative Radio Therapist. Requests for lecture lists and further information should be sent to the Co-ordinating Secretary, Southampton Medical Group, 52 University Road, Southampton SO9 5NH.

### Aberdeen Medical Group

Aberdeen - where the stethoscopes stretch as far as the murmuring praecordia of Orkney and Shetland

- is the latest University to establish a Medical Group following the pattern of the LMG and associated with the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics. This makes it the third medical group to be established in Scotland, the Edinburgh group having been set up in 1967 and Glasgow in 1973.

From its roots as an ancient centre of medical excellence Aberdeen has developed its health care from that of largely rural and fishing communities - where a home visit may necessitate scrambling over sheep pens in a blizzard to an isolated croft - to involve an additional responsibility, the rig morbidity of cosmopolitan oilmen. The AMG programme reflects the difficulties and issues shared with other regions and explored by other Medical Groups, as well as opening up new areas of particularly local concern.

The inaugural lecture was given by Dr Cicely Saunders, OBE, MA, MD, FRCP on 'The Nature and Management of Terminal Pain' at 5.30 pm on April 18, 1978, in the Auditorium, Medical Buildings, Foresterhill. A hypercapacity audience of 360 broke the previous attendance record of the Auditorium, with a tidal surge of multidisciplines overflowing into the aisles, leaving some members of the Consultative Council washed up in the standing room only zone at the back. Subsequent symposia in the 1978 lecture list include discussion of the management of alcoholism, spina bifida, euthanasia, health care in island and other remote communities, and the film *Birth: with R D Laing*.

The inaugural President of the AMG is James Hendry, a sixth year medical student; the Chairman of the Consultative Council is Professor A G M Campbell, DCH, FRCP,

Professor of Child Health in the University of Aberdeen; and the Co-ordinating Secretary is Dr Jane Edgcumbe, MB, BS, Registrar in Psychiatry at the Ross Clinic, Aberdeen, who would be glad to supply further details to those interested.

### Staff change

Penny Stewart, SRN, who has been secretary to the Director of the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics since 1972, has left in order to marry.

On 24 February the President of the London Medical Group, Ian Kunkler, on behalf of past and present members of the Representative and Consultative Councils, presented her with a silver salver as a token of appreciation.

Mrs Sheila Finnis has been appointed Secretary and Personal Assistant to the Director from 1 May 1978.

### Medical Sociology News

This is the newsletter of the British Sociological Association Medical Sociology Group. It contains short articles of topical interest, reviews of newly published books, and news of national and regional meetings for medical sociology. It is published three times a year and mailed free to individual members of the group. There is a small charge for institutional subscribers and foreign readers. Details of group membership are available from the Convenor, Dr G V Stimson, Addiction Research Unit, Institute of Psychiatry, 101 Denmark Hill, London SE5 8AF. All correspondence concerning *Medical Sociology News* should be sent to the Editor, David Hall, Medical Sociology Research Centre, Park Buildings, Park Street, Swansea SA1 3DJ.

### Annual conference: Medical Sociology conference, 1978

The conference, organised by the Medical Sociology Group of the British Sociological Association, is to be held at York University 22-24 September 1978. This year's main theme is the Sociology of health and illness in North America and Britain. Papers of relevance to this theme will be especially welcome.

There will be the usual mix of study groups, workshops and plenary sessions on the sociology of health and illness. John Ehrenreich will talk on the 'Cultural critique of medicine and implications for alternative approaches to health care'.

Abstracts of papers should be sent to: Sally MacIntyre, Institute of Medical Sociology, Westburn Road, Aberdeen not later than 31 July 1978.

Bookings to: Gerry Stimson, Medical Sociology Conference, Addiction Research Unit, Institute of Psychiatry, 101 Denmark Hill, London SE5 8AF by 1 September 1978. Please book early and enclose SAE.

### Vacancy in Canada

DIRECTOR

*Centre for ethics and human values*

Westminster College, in association

with The University of Western Ontario, is establishing a new centre for research on ethics and problems affecting the quality of human life, institutions, and culture. The new centre will be interdisciplinary in character, and will focus upon ethical, social, legal, theological and philosophical dimensions of public policy, technology, and problems affecting the quality of human life and institutions. There will be collaboration with established and developing teaching programmes in the University.

The Director's responsibilities will include: active involvement in and leadership of the research activities of the centre, overall operation of the centre, preparation of budgets, grant proposals, and reports, recruitment and supervision of personnel. Teaching on a limited basis in one or more University programmes may be arranged. The Director will participate in the planning of the centre's initial structure and make recommendations on suitable research directions to its governing board. This is a senior academic and administrative position to be available on or before July 1, 1979. Initial and continuing funding for the centre has already been established.

Nominations and applications

for the position are invited and should include a *curriculum vitae* list of publications, and names of three referees, and be addressed to: Mr W Lockwood Miller, Chairman, Search Committee, Centre for Ethics and Human Values, Westminster College, London, Ontario, N6G 2M2.

### Correction and apology

In our last issue, Volume 4, number 1, the article by C K Drinkwater and S H Roberts, entitled 'Cure or care in everyday practice' was written while they were at Memorial University, Newfoundland lecturing in Family Practice and Medicine respectively, and not in Newcastle-upon-Tyne as our titling would suggest.

We apologise to both Dr Drinkwater and Dr Roberts for changing the original titling from Newfoundland to Newcastle, and thus possibly confusing our readers into thinking that the Geordies preferred the dollar!

**President**

The Rt Hon Lord Amulree

**Director of Studies**

Edward Shotter

**Scottish Director**

Kenneth Boyd

**Assistant Directors (Honorary)**

Brendan Callaghan

Raanan Gillon

Richard Nicholson

John Sedgwick

**Treasurer** Kenneth Darke**Secretaries**

Sheila Finnis

Helen Horton

## GOVERNING BODY

**Lord Amulree** Chairman*President, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics***R B Welbourn** Vice-Chairman*Professor of Surgery, Royal Post-graduate Medical School***R D Catterall***Consultant Venereologist, Middlesex Hospital***Sir Cyril Clarke***Past President, Royal College of Physicians***Kenneth Darke***Senior Treasurer, ex officio***A S Duncan***Emeritus Professor of Medical Education, Edinburgh***G R Dunstan***Professor of Moral & Social Theology, King's College, London***C D Falconer***Scottish Secretary, British Medical Association***C M Fletcher***Emeritus Professor of Clinical Epidemiology, University of London***T W A Glenister***Dean, Charing Cross Hospital***Anthony Thorley***Consultant Psychiatrist, Newcastle***Sir Brian Windeyer***former Vice-Chancellor, University of London***Lord Winstanley***General Practitioner***Ian Kunkler***St Bartholomew's Hospital Medical School***Stephen Krikler***Middlesex Hospital Medical School***Christopher Mace***St Mary's Hospital Medical School***Martin Waldron***Royal Free Hospital Medical School***Edward Shotter***Director of Studies, ex officio*

# Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

The Society for the Study of Medical Ethics is an independent, non-partisan organisation for the multidisciplinary study of issues raised by the practice of medicine.

The Society aims to influence the quality of both professional and public discussion of medico-moral questions; to promote the study of medical ethics; to ensure a high academic standard for this developing subject; to encourage a multidisciplinary approach to discussion of the consequences of clinical practice; to stimulate research in specific problems; to remain non-partisan and independent of all interest groups and lobbies.

Since 1963 the London Medical Group, a student group for the study of issues raised by the practice of medicine, has arranged a series of lectures and symposia, now twice weekly throughout the academic year, in the 12 London teaching hospitals and medical schools.

In 1967 the Edinburgh Medical Group was established with similar aims, and subsequently medical groups have been formed in a majority of the British medical schools—currently Newcastle, Sheffield, Glasgow, Bristol, Birmingham, Manchester, Liverpool, Cardiff, Southampton and Aberdeen.

In 1972 junior doctors, who had themselves been associated with the London Medical Group, founded the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics to develop these aims at a postgraduate level.

In 1975 research fellows were appointed by the Edinburgh Medical Group which has established, in conjunction with the University of Edinburgh, a research project in medical ethics and education. This is funded by the Leverhulme Trust Fund and the Nuffield Provincial Hospitals Trust.

The Society for the Study of Medical Ethics is a registered educational charity and a Company Limited by Guarantee. It relies on voluntary grants and donations and is not supported from government sources.

There is no individual membership of the Society. Those interested in this work are invited to subscribe to the *Journal of medical ethics*. The lectures, symposia and conferences of the associated medical groups, although addressed primarily to medical, nursing and other students, are open to all those professionally interested. Details are published in the journal.

**Society for the Study of Medical Ethics**

Tavistock House North, Tavistock Square, London, WC1H 9LG.

Tel: 01-387 8132