

Journal of medical ethics

Volume four
Numbers 1-4

The Journal of the
Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

Editor

A V Campbell

Consulting Editors

A S Duncan

C M Fletcher

Editorial Board

R B Welbourn (Chairman)

Sir William Ferguson Anderson

Kenneth Boyd

R D Catterall

Sir John Donne

Robin Downie

G R Dunstan

Roger Higgs

Gerard Hughes

Ian Kennedy

Lord Kilbrandon

Marshall Marinker

Raymond Plant

Sir Martin Roth

Tony Smith

Margaret Stacey

Anthony Thorley

Eric Wilkes

Edward Shotter

Technical Editor

Dorothy Mitchell Smith

Society for the Study of Medical Ethics,
Tavistock Square, London WC1

Journal of medical ethics

The Journal of the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

Editor

A V Campbell

Consulting Editors

A S Duncan

C M Fletcher

Editorial Board

R B Welbourn (Chairman)

Sir William Ferguson Anderson

Kenneth Boyd

R D Catterall

Sir John Donne

Robin Downie

G R Dunstan

Roger Higgs

Gerard Hughes

Ian Kennedy

Lord Kilbrandon

Marshall Marinker

Raymond Plant

Sir Martin Roth

Tony Smith

Margaret Stacey

Anthony Thorley

Edward Shotter

Technical Editor

Dorothy Mitchell Smith

Contents

Editorial

- 3 In search of justice
Screening for spina bifida

Main articles

- 5 Gifts, exchanges and the political economy of health care
Part II How should health care be distributed?
Raymond Plant
- 12 Cure or care in everyday practice
C K Drinkwater and S H Roberts
- 18 Sterilisation: The Aberdeen experience, and some broader implications
Sue Teper
- 25 Recent and possible future trends in abortion
François Lafitte
- 30 Fetal survival – who decides?
Iain R McFadyen
- 32 Leukaemia in children of Jehovah's Witnesses: issues and priorities in a conflict of care
P J Kearney
- 36 The teaching of medical ethics: University College, Cork, Ireland
Dolores Dooley Clarke

Analysis

- 40 Self-determination
R F Stalley

Case conference

- 42 Conflict of loyalties – Hippocratic or hypocritical?

The parliamentary scene

- 45 Why doctors cause politicians trouble
Tony Smith
- 47 Book Reviews
- 49 Correspondence
- 51 Lectures and symposia
- 54 News and notes

Journal of medical ethics

The Society for the Study of Medical Ethics is an independent and non-partisan organization for the multidisciplinary study of issues raised by the practice of medicine. The *Journal of medical ethics* is published by the Society quarterly. It is addressed primarily to members of the medical and allied professions, but subscriptions are accepted from all those interested in medical ethics.

Submitting manuscripts for publication

Papers submitted for publication should be sent in duplicate to Dr A V Campbell, the Editor, *Journal of medical ethics*, University of Edinburgh, New College, The Mound, Edinburgh EH1 2LX. They should be in double-spaced typewriting on one side of the paper only. On the paper the name of the author should appear with initials or distinguishing christian name and the address to which editorial communications should be sent.

Abbreviations should be avoided except for those in general use. The names of journals, organisations, etc, should be printed in full.

References

In the list of references at the end of a paper each should be numbered in the order in which each reference appears in the text, and these numbers should be shown as superscripts in the text itself: thus, for example, in the text Bowden¹ and in the list ¹ Bowden, Paul, *Journal of medical ethics* 1976, 2, 163-172. A reference to a book would also be indicated in the text by a number set above the line and quoted in the list by that number thus: ¹ Abel-Smith, Brian, *Value for Money in Health Services*. Heinemann, London, 1976. However, exceptions will be made when references are quoted according to the common practice of a particular discipline, eg, the law, when to alter these would cause confusion to specialists likely to use the reference list.

Four copies of the journal will be sent to authors free of charge after their papers are published. Reprints of individual papers may be bought from The Publisher, *Journal of medical ethics*, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

Notice to subscribers

The *Journal of medical ethics* is published quarterly. The annual subscription rates is £12.00 in the United Kingdom and Irish Republic, and US \$25.00 in all countries overseas. Payment for overseas subscriptions should be made in dollars, ie, US \$25.00, or in your national currency based on the prevailing exchange rate to the US dollar of that currency, payable to Professional and Scientific Publications/JME A/c. Orders can also be placed locally with any leading subscription agent or bookseller. (For the convenience of readers in the USA subscription orders, with or without payment, can also be sent to: Professional and Scientific Publications, 1172 Commonwealth Avenue, Boston, Mass. 02134. All enquiries, however, must be addressed to the Publisher in London.) All enquiries regarding Air Mail rates, single copies, advertisements, etc. should be sent to: The Publisher, *Journal of medical ethics*, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

ISSN 0306-6800

Contributors to this issue

Dolores D Clarke lectures in Philosophy at University College, Cork, Ireland.

C K Drinkwater is senior lecturer in Family Medicine at the University of Newcastle-upon-Tyne.

Peter J Huntingford is Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology in the University of London jointly at St Bartholomew's and The London Hospital Medical Colleges.

Peter Kearney is at present lecturer in Child Health at the University of Bristol, but is shortly to become Consultant Paediatrician at The Regional Hospital, Limerick, Ireland.

Francois Lafitte is Professor of Social Policy and Administration in the University of Birmingham and Head of its Social Administration Department; he is also Chairman of the British Pregnancy Advisory Service.

Iain R McFadyen is a Consultant in the Division of Perinatal Medicine at Northwich Park Hospital and Clinical Research Centre, Harrow, Middlesex.

Raymond Plant is a senior lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Manchester.

S H Roberts is a senior research associate in the Department of Medicine at the University of Newcastle-upon-Tyne.

R F Stalley is lecturer in Moral Philosophy in the University of Glasgow.

Sue Teper is a research demographer at the MRC Institute of Medical Sociology, Aberdeen.

American Correspondent

Bernard Towers, *University of California*

Copyright © 1978 *Journal of medical ethics*. All Rights Reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the *Journal of medical ethics*.

Lectures and symposia

Thursday 2 March

LMG symposium: AN APPLE A DAY: Should Doctors Educate the Public? 6 pm St George's Hospital, Tooting

Professor A H Crisp, Professor of Psychiatry, St George's Hospital Medical School

Professor Charles Fletcher, Emeritus Professor of Clinical Epidemiology, Royal Postgraduate Medical School

Dr J Tudor Hart, general practitioner, author of 'The Inverse Care Law'

Dr George Cust, Chief Medical Officer, Health Education Council

Monday 6 March

NMG symposium: IS BIG BEAUTIFUL? 5.15 pm The New Lecture Theatre, Royal Victoria Infirmary, Newcastle

Professor David Kerr, Medicine; Dr Andrew Smith, general practitioner

Mrs J Turner, divisional nursing officer

Tuesday 7 March

LMG lecture: NO PLACE LIKE HOME: THE EFFECT OF THE INSTITUTION ON THE ABANDONED CHILD 5.45 pm St Mary's Hospital Medical School

Dr Stephen Wolkind, senior lecturer in psychiatry, The London Hospital Medical College

Tuesday 7 March

LMG symposium: THE FUTURE OF THE COTTAGE HOSPITAL: IS THE ROYAL LIVERPOOL HOSPITAL REALLY NEEDED? 5.15 pm Royal Liverpool Hospital College

Professor A J Bellingham, Professor of Haematology, University of Liverpool

Dr Cyril Taylor, general

practitioner, Liverpool;

Mr J Howell-Hughes, Chairman of the Commissioning Team

Tuesday 7 March

BMG lecture: CLINICAL DEPRESSION: IS IT A SOCIAL PHENOMENON? 7.30 pm Level 9 Lecture Theatre, Bristol Royal Infirmary

Professor G W Brown, Department of Sociology, Bedford College

Thursday 9 March

CMG lecture: GOALS OF THE HANDICAPPED? THE CARE OF HANDICAPPED PEOPLE IN BRITAIN 5.30 pm Lecture Theatre 2, Welsh National School of Medicine, University Hospital of Wales

Dr Albert Kushlick, Medical Research Council, Wessex Regional Health Authority

Thursday 9 March

LMG symposium: ECT: TREATMENT OR TORTURE? 5.45 pm St Thomas's Hospital Medical School

Professor W W Holland, Professor of Community Medicine, St Thomas's Hospital

Dr Anthony Clare, senior registrar, Maudsley Hospital, author of 'Psychiatry in Dissent'

Mr John Barter, education officer, MIND, National Association of Mental Health

Dr David Gill, senior registrar, Psychiatry, Knowles Hospital

Tuesday 14 March

BMG symposium: THE SELECTION OF MEDICAL STUDENTS 5.30 pm Clinical Lecture Theatre, The Medical School, University of Birmingham

Dr R E Lee, Admissions Tutor
Dr J Tudor Hart, general practitioner

Tuesday 14 March

LMG symposium: INTRODUCING NEW DRUGS: THE ETHICS OF RISK 5.45 pm University College Hospital Medical School

Professor Duncan Vere, Professor of Therapeutics, University of London and The London Hospital Medical College

Dr Colin Downie, Technical Services, Director, I.C.I. Pharmaceuticals Division

Mr Alec Purkis, former chairman, Thalidomide Society, and a parent

Tuesday 15 March

SMG lecture: HUMOUR IN MEDICINE 5.30 pm New Medical School, Beech Hill Road, Sheffield

Dr J M H Moll, consultant rheumatologist, Nether Edge Hospital

Wednesday 11 April

SMG lecture: SPINA BIFIDA—AN INTRODUCTION 5.30 pm New Medical School, Beech Hill Road, Sheffield

Dr John Lorber, Reader in Child Health, The Children's Hospital, Sheffield

Tuesday 11 April

LMG lecture: CAN PSYCHOLOGISTS CURE MENTAL ILLNESS? 6 pm Charing Cross Hospital, Fulham

Professor H J Bysenck, Director, The Research Laboratories, Institute of Psychiatry

Thursday 13 April

LMG lecture: THE THREAT OF THE EDUCATED PATIENT 5.45 pm Guy's Hospital Medical School

Miss Katharine Whitehorn, journalist, *The Observer*

Tuesday 18 April

LMG symposium: EMPTY MENTAL

HOSPITALS = FULL PRISONS: OK ?
5.45 pm King's College Hospital
Medical School

Dr Philip Hugh Jones, Director
of the Chest Unit, King's College
Hospital Medical School

Dr John Gunn, senior lecturer
in forensic psychiatry, Institute of
Psychiatry

Dr Henry Rollin, formerly
consultant psychiatrist, Horton
Hospital

Thursday 20 April

LMG symposium: THE QUALIFIED
FAILURE: WHAT TO DO WITH BAD
DOCTORS ? 5.45 pm The London
Hospital Medical College

Dr John Ellis, Dean, The London
Hospital Medical College

Sir John Richardson, President,
General Medical Council

Dr Elston Grey-Turner,
Secretary, British Medical
Association

Tuesday 25 April

LMG symposium: SEXUAL
SURROGATES: SERVICE OR SCANDAL ?
5.45 pm Middlesex Hospital
Medical School

Dr Philip Boyd, consultant
psychiatrist, Middlesex Hospital

Dr Patricia Gillan, senior
psychologist, Rochford General
Hospital, honorary psychologist &
therapist, Psycho-Sexual Clinic,
Maudsley Hospital

Mr Philip Hodson, editor of
Forum

Friday 28 April

LMG symposium: HUMAN
GUINEA PIGS 5.15 pm Royal
Liverpool Hospital College

Professor Denis Bromley,
Professor of Psychology, University
of Liverpool

Dr M H Pappworth, London,
author of 'Human Guinea Pigs'

Professor H Keen, Professor of
Medicine, Guy's Hospital

Tuesday 2 May

LMG lecture: DEPRESSION: IS IT
ALWAYS AN ILLNESS ? 5.45 pm
Royal Free Hospital, Hampstead

Dr Jack Dominian, consultant
psychiatrist, Central Middlesex
Hospital, author of 'Depression'

Thursday 4 May

BMG lecture: PRINCIPALS AND
REALITY IN THE NHS 5.30 pm
Clinical Lecture Theatre, The
Medical School, University of
Birmingham

Mrs Jill Knight, MP for
Edgbaston

Monday 8 May

NMG symposium: FALLING OFF
THE MEDICAL PYRAMID ? 5.15 pm
The New Lecture Theatre, Royal
Victoria Infirmary, Newcastle

Professor John Walton, Dean of
of Medicine

Dr Ann Horler, Medical
Women's Federation

Professor Ian Rannie, dental
pathology, member of the
Manpower Services Commission

Tuesday 9 May

LMG symposium: BREAST
FEEDING: BACK ON THE BOTTLE ?
5.45 pm St Bartholomew's Hospital

Dr John Walker Smith, consultant
paediatrician, St Bartholomew's
Hospital

Dr Sylvia Drake, Principal
Medical Officer, Nutrition,
Department of Health & Social
Security

Dr Penelope Stanway, formerly
Senior Medical Officer, London
Borough of Croydon, author of
'Breast is Best'

Mrs Maire Davies, Chairman,
Breast Feeding Promotion Group,
National Childbirth Trust

Thursday 11 May

LMG symposium: ANIMAL
EXPERIMENTATION: CAN WE DO
WITHOUT IT ? 6 pm St George's
Hospital, Tooting

Professor A C Dornhorst,
Professor of Medicine, St George's
Hospital Medical School

Dr W Lane-Petter, University
of Cambridge

Mr Richard Ryder, senior clinical
psychologist, Warneford Hospital,
Oxford

Dr Andrew Rowan, scientific
administrator, FRAME, Fund for
the Replacement of Animals in
Medical Experiments

Thursday 11 May

GMG Symposium: WOMEN IN
MEDICINE—IS FIFTY PERCENT TOO
MANY ? 5.30 pm Integrated Year

Lecture Room, Western Infirmary,
Glasgow

Dr Helen Zealley, Specialist
Community Medicine, Lothian
Health Board

Dr Ann Blyth, Department of
Surgery, Vale of Leven Hospital

Tuesday 16 May

LMG symposium: WHO HELPS
THE HELPERS ? THE EMOTIONAL
COST OF CLINICAL PRACTICE 5.45 pm
St Mary's Hospital Medical
School

Dr Conrad M Harris, Director,
Department of General Practice,
St Mary's Hospital

Dr Robin Murray, senior
psychiatric registrar, Maudsley
Hospital

Mrs Tessa Jowell, Assistant
Director of Social Services, MIND
National Association of Mental
Health

Thursday 18 May

LMG symposium: WHOSE PATIENT ?
CONFLICTS IN MEDICAL
RESPONSIBILITY 5.45 pm St
Thomas's Hospital

Dr J D Pollitt, Physician in
Charge, Department of
Psychological Medicine, St
Thomas's Hospital

Professor Sir Denis Hill,
Professor of Psychiatry, Institute of
Psychiatry

Miss Peggy Nuttall, managing
editor, *Nursing Times*

Tuesday 23 May

LMG symposium: DEPENDENCY:
ARE WE ALL HOOKED ON SOMETHING ?
5.45 pm University College Hospital
Medical School

Professor Oliver Wrong,
Director, Department of Medicine,
UCH Medical School; Professor
Sydney Brandon, Professor of
Psychiatry, University of
Leicester

Dr Emanuel Moran,
consultant psychiatrist, Enfield
District Hospital, adviser to
Gamblers Anonymous

Dr Trevor Silverstone,
consultant psychiatrist, Academic
Unit for Human
Psychopharmacology, St
Bartholomew's Hospital

Thursday 25 May

LMG symposium: THE FIVE
MINUTE INTERVIEW: THE END OF

GENERAL PRACTICE ? 6.15 pm
Westminster Medical School
Mr P D Trevor Roper,
consultant ophthalmic surgeon,
Westminster Hospital
Dr Graham Curtis Jenkins,
general practitioner, Ashford
Professor Patrick Byrne,
Professor of General Practice,

University Health Centre,
Manchester
Mr David Tuckett, lecturer in
sociology, Principal, Health
Education Studies Unit,
Hughes Hall, Cambridge
Wednesday 31 May
BMG symposium: WHICH WAY IN

MEDICAL EDUCATION ? 7.30 pm
Level 9 Lecture Theatre, Bristol
Royal Infirmary
Mr Ivor Shipley, Open Medicine
Trust Open University
Professor N R Butler,
Department of Paediatrics,
University of Bristol
Dr F T Page

News and notes

Workshops in medical and biological ethics

The Institute of Society, Ethics and the Life Sciences will sponsor three summer workshops in 1978. The *Workshop on Bioethics and Public Policy* will focus on public policy implications of current issues in medical and biological ethics and will run June 25–July 2, 1978, at Sarah Lawrence College in Bronxville, New York. A *Workshop on Pediatrics, Ethics, and the Law*, examining the ethical and legal issues surrounding medical and health care of children, will be held June 25–July 1, 1978, at Dominican College, San Rafael, California. A third workshop on *Clinical Medical Ethics* will be held July 16–23, 1978, at Dartmouth College in New Hampshire. A brochure describing workshop agenda, registration, and costs is available from Patricia Pierce, 914-478 0500, Institute of Society, Ethics and the Life Sciences, The Hastings Center, 360 Broadway, Hastings-on-Hudson,

New York, 10706, or call (914) 478-0500.

Peter Scott Memorial Fund

The distinguished forensic psychiatrist, Dr Peter Scott, of the Bethlem/Maudsley Hospitals and the Home Office, died in August last year. His death has left an unbreachable gap in British forensic psychiatry and criminology. For thirty years his writings, teaching, and practice have helped Courts and penal and social agencies in this country to arrive at a just, humane, and helpful disposition of offenders. His counsel has supported doctors, caring services, and police in testing situations. His experience and wisdom were frequently drawn upon by prestigious and influential advisory committees which have helped to formulate national policy in penology and psychiatry. Students of his over the years have carried his humanity and clear-sightedness throughout the world.

Many of Peter Scott's friends and colleagues wish his life and work to be commemorated, and to this end a Memorial Fund has been launched under the auspices of the Royal College of Psychiatrists. The aim of the Fund is to further education and research in forensic psychiatry. Dr Scott was particularly dedicated to the teaching and encouragement of young psychiatrists and it is felt that the aim of this Appeal is one of which he would have approved.

Those interested in supporting this Fund should send donations to The Peter Scott Memorial Fund, The Royal College of Psychiatrists, 17 Belgrave Square, London SW1X 8PG, cheques should be made payable to The Royal College of Psychiatrists (Peter Scott Memorial Fund).

ROBERT BLUGLASS, FRCPsych
Secretary
*Peter Scott Memorial
Fund Appeal Committee*

President

The Rt Hon Lord Amulree

Director of Studies

Edward Shotter

Scottish Director

Kenneth Boyd

Assistant Directors (Honorary)

Brendan Callaghan

Richard Nicholson

John Sedgwick

Treasurer Kenneth Darke

Secretaries Penny Stewart

Helen Horton

Governing Body

Lord Amulree Chairman

President, Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

R B Welbourn Vice-Chairman

Professor of Surgery, Royal Post-graduate Medical School

P S deQ Cabot

Management Consultant

R D Catterall

Consultant Venereologist, Middlesex Hospital

Sir Cyril Clarke

Past President, Royal College of Physicians

Kenneth Darke

Senior Treasurer, ex officio

A S Duncan

Emeritus Professor of Medical Education, Edinburgh

G R Dunstan

Professor of Moral & Social Theology, King's College, London

C D Falconer

Scottish Secretary, British Medical Association

C M Fletcher

Emeritus Professor of Clinical Epidemiology, University of London

T W A Glenister

Dean, Charing Cross Hospital

O M Lidwell

Medical Research Council

Anthony Thorley

Consultant Psychiatrist, Newcastle

Sir Brian Windeyer

former Vice-Chancellor, University of London

Lord Winstanley

General Practitioner

Ian Munkler

St Bartholomew's Hospital Medical College

Dorian Haskard

Middlesex Hospital Medical School

Diane James

Guy's Hospital Medical School

Stephen Krikler

Middlesex Hospital Medical School

Edward Shotter

Director of Studies, ex officio

Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

The Society for the Study of Medical Ethics is an independent, non-partisan organization for the multidisciplinary study of issues raised by the practice of medicine.

The Society aims to influence the quality of both professional and public discussion of medico-moral questions; to promote the study of medical ethics; to ensure a high academic standard for this developing subject; to encourage a multidisciplinary approach to discussion of the consequences of clinical practice; to stimulate research in specific problems; to remain non-partisan and independent of all interest groups and lobbies.

Since 1963 the London Medical Group, a student group for the study of issues raised by the practice of medicine, has arranged a series of lectures and symposia, now twice weekly throughout the academic year, in the 12 London teaching hospitals and medical schools.

In 1967 the Edinburgh Medical Group was established with similar aims, and subsequently medical groups have been formed in a majority of the British medical schools—currently Newcastle, Sheffield, Glasgow, Bristol, Birmingham, Manchester, Liverpool and Cardiff.

In 1972 junior doctors, who had themselves been associated with the London Medical Group, founded the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics to develop these aims at a postgraduate level.

DOCUMENTATION in Medical Ethics, superseded as the organ of the Society by the *Journal of medical ethics*, is now produced as the proceedings of the annual conference held in conjunction with the London Medical Group.

In 1975 research fellows were appointed by the Edinburgh Medical Group which has established, in conjunction with the University of Edinburgh, a research project in medical ethics and education. This is funded by the Leverhulme Trust Fund and the Nuffield Provincial Hospitals Trust.

The Society for the Study of Medical Ethics is a registered educational charity and a Company Limited by Guarantee. It relies on voluntary grants and donations and is not supported from government sources.

There is no individual membership of the Society. Those interested in this work are invited to subscribe to the *Journal of medical ethics*. The lectures of the London Medical Group and the other associated medical groups, although addressed primarily to medical, nursing and other students, are open to all those professionally interested. There is no charge.

ADDRESS: Society for the Study of Medical Ethics
Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London, WC1H 9LG.
Tel: 01-387 8132