

# Journal of medical ethics

**Volume three  
Numbers 1-4**

**The Journal of the  
Society for the Study of Medical Ethics**

*Editor*

A V Campbell

*Consulting Editors*

A S Duncan

C M Fletcher

*Editorial Board*

R B Welbourn (Chairman)

Sir William Ferguson Anderson

Kenneth Boyd

R D Catterall

Sir John Donne

Robin Downie

G R Dunstan

Roger Higgs

Gerard Hughes

Ian Kennedy

Lord Kilbrandon

Marshall Marinker

Raymond Plant

Sir Martin Roth

Tony Smith

Margaret Stacey

Anthony Thorley

Edward Shotter

*Technical Editor*

Gunilla Liddle

Society for the Study of Medical Ethics,  
Tavistock Square, London WC1

# Journal of medical ethics

## The Journal of the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

### *Editor*

A V Campbell

### *Consulting Editors*

A S Duncan

C M Fletcher

### *Editorial Board*

R B Welbourn (Chairman)

Patrick Byrne

R Y Calne

R D Catterall

J Dominian

G R Dunstan

Roger Higgs

Lord Kilbrandon

Gordon Horobin

W S Peart

Raymond Plant

Dame Muriel Powell

Anthony Thorley

Sir Martin Roth

Cicely Saunders

Tony Smith

Edward Shotter

### *Technical Editor*

Gunilla Liddle

## Contents

### Editorial

1 'On dying and on dying well'

2 'Physician heal thyself'

2 Where are the promised secure units for the mentally ill?

### Focus

4 The diagnosis of brain death

*Bryan Jennett*

The definition of death

5 *Ian Kennedy*

### Main articles

7 Do drug advertisements provide therapeutic information?

*Gerry V Stimson*

14 Ethical problems of repetitive research

*Report of a working party*

18 Attitudes towards euthanasia

*Carolyn Winget, Frederic T Kapp and Rosalee C Yeaworth*

26 Medical humanities: An aid to ethical discussions

*Anthony Moore*

33 'The implications of medical ethics'

*Amnon Goldworth and Ian E Thompson*

### Case conference

36 A Rhesus dilemma

### Analysis

40 *Dignity*

*Elizabeth Maclaren*

42 Report from America

*Bernard Towers*

49 **The parliamentary scene**

*Tony Smith*

50 Correspondence

52 Lectures and symposia

54 News and notes

## Lectures and symposia

### Tuesday 1 March

LMG symposium: EXORCISM 5.45 pm  
St Bartholomew's Hospital

Professor Ian McColl,  
Professor of Surgery,  
Guy's Hospital (Chairman);  
The Revd Don Cupitt, Dean,  
Emmanuel College, Cambridge;  
Dr William Sargent, hon consultant  
psychiatrist, St Thomas's Hospital

### Thursday 3 March

LMG symposium: INCEST 6.00 pm  
St George's Hospital, Tooting

Dr Paul T d'Orban,  
consulting psychiatrist,  
St George's Hospital (Chairman);  
Pauline Crabbe OBE, Brook  
Advisory Centre; D J Tibbets, OBE,  
senior probation officer;  
Professor John K Marson, CBE,  
Professor of Forensic Medicine,  
University of Edinburgh

### Tuesday 8 March

BMG symposium: GRIEF 7.30 pm  
Level 9, Lecture Theatre,  
Bristol Royal Infirmary.

Professor Russell Davis  
(Chairman); Dr Colin Murray  
Parkes, author of *Bereavement*;  
Derek Nuttall, Cruse National  
Widows Association

### Tuesday 8 March

LpMG symposium: PATIENTS FOR  
TEACHING? 5.15 pm Medical  
Teaching Centre, Mount Vernon  
Street, Liverpool.

Professor A M Breckenridge,  
Professor of Clinical Pharmacology,  
University of Liverpool; Jane  
Leighton, Community Health  
Council

### Tuesday 8 March

LMG symposium: COT DEATHS  
5.45 pm St Mary's Hospital  
Medical School.

Professor Thomas Oppé,  
Professor of Paediatrics, St Mary's  
Hospital (Chairman); Lady  
Limerick, Vice-Chairman,  
Foundation for the Study of Infant  
Deaths; Professor John L Emery,

consultant paediatric pathologist,  
The Children's Hospital, Sheffield;  
Dr Robert Walker, GP and parent

### Thursday 10 March

LMG symposium:

THE ETHICS OF INFANTICIDE  
5.45 pm St Thomas's Hospital  
Dr W D Wylie, Dean, St  
Thomas's Hospital (Chairman);  
The Rt Hon Lord Justice Lawton,  
Lord Justice of Appeal;  
Dr Elizabeth Tylden, consultant  
psychiatrist, St Mary's Hospital;  
Jonathan Glover, tutor in  
philosophy, New College, Oxford

### Thursday 10 March

CMG symposium: TOO OLD TO CARE  
5.30 pm Welsh National School of  
Medicine, Cardiff

Dr S R Willington, consultant  
physician in geriatric medicine,  
Cardiff (Chairman); Dr John Agate,  
consultant geriatrician, Ipswich;  
Adrian Evans, area administrator,  
South Glamorgan Area Health  
Authority; Professor Alan Williams,  
Department of Economics,  
University of York

### Tuesday 15 March

BiMG symposium: STERILIZATION  
5.30 pm Clinical Lecture Theatre,  
Clinical Research Block, Queen  
Elizabeth Hospital, Birmingham

Dr J A Jordan, consultant  
obstetrician and gynaecologist;  
The Revd Dr Anthony Bird,  
Principal of the Queens College,  
Birmingham

### Tuesday 15 March

LMG lecture: THE END OF  
THE DOCTOR-PATIENT RELATIONSHIP?  
5.45 University College Hospital  
Medical School

Professor Marshall Marinker,  
Professor of Community Medicine,  
University of Leicester

### Tuesday 15 March

SMG lecture: HUMOUR IN MEDICINE  
5.30 pm New Medical School,

Beech Hill Road, Sheffield  
Dr J M H Moll, consultant  
rheumatologist, Nether Edge  
Hospital

### Thursday 17 March

LMG symposium: THE AVAILABILITY  
OF ABORTION: A GEOGRAPHY OF  
MORALS 6.15 pm Westminster  
Medical School

Dr Richard Farmer, senior  
lecturer in community medicine,  
Westminster Medical School  
(Chairman); Professor Francois  
Lafitte, Professor of Social Policy  
and Administration, University of  
Birmingham; Mrs Juliet Cheetham,  
lecturer in applied social studies,  
University of Oxford

### Tuesday 22 March

BMG lecture: ABUSES OF CLINICAL  
INVESTIGATION 7.30 pm Level 9,  
Lecture Theatre, Bristol Royal  
Infirmary

Dr M H Pappworth, author of  
*Human Guinea Pigs*

### Tuesday 22 March

LMG symposium: MISUSE OF  
PSYCHIATRY: NOT ONLY IN THE  
SOVIET UNION 6 pm

Charing Cross Hospital, Fulham  
Dr Malcolm Weller, lecturer in  
psychiatry, Charing Cross Hospital  
(Chairman); Professor John Wing,  
Professor of Social Psychiatry,  
Institute of Psychiatry; Larry  
Gostin, legal advisor MIND

### Thursday 24 March

LMG symposium:  
SEX AND THE DISABLED  
6.00 pm Guy's Hospital Medical  
School

Dr Donald Craig, honorary  
lecturer, Department of General  
Practice, Guy's Hospital Medical  
School (Chairman); W F R Stewart,  
Development Officer, Committee  
on Sexual Problems of the Disabled;  
Roy Billington, counsellor-adviser,  
The Leonard Cheshire Foundation;  
Dr Wendy Greengross,  
broadcaster and author

**Monday 28 March****NMG symposium:****STUDENTS UNDER STRESS**

5.15 pm New Lecture Theatre,  
Royal Victoria Infirmary, Newcastle

Dr Graham Grant, University  
Health Service (Chairman); Mrs  
Janet Clark, social worker,  
University Health Service;  
Dr Humphrey Richardson,  
consultant psychiatrist

**Monday 4 April****CMG lecture:****EFFECTIVENESS AND EFFICIENCY**

5.30 pm Welsh National School of  
Medicine, Cardiff

Professor A C Cochrane, former  
Director of the Medical Research  
Council (Epidemiology Unit)  
South Wales

**Tuesday 5 April****BMG lecture:****THE VALUE OF HUMAN LIFE**

7.30 pm Level 9, Lecture Theatre,  
Bristol Royal Infirmary

The Most Revd Metropolitan  
Anthony of Sourozh

**Wednesday 13 April****BMG symposium: DRUG****PROMOTION—IN WHOSE INTEREST?**

7.30 pm Level 9, Lecture Theatre,  
Bristol Royal Infirmary

Dr G R Burston (Chairman);  
Dr Clifford Hawkins, consultant  
physician, Birmingham; Dr  
Miriam Stoppard, Medical Director,  
Syntex Pharmaceuticals Ltd

**Tuesday 19 April****LMG lecture: MARITAL BREAKDOWN**

5.45 pm King's College  
Hospital Medical School

Dr Jack Dominian, consultant  
psychiatrist, Central Middlesex  
Hospital

**Thursday 21 April****LMG symposium: CLINICAL AND  
ETHICAL ASPECTS OF GENDER IDENTITY**

5.45 pm The London Hospital  
Medical College

Dr A. Stuart Mason, consultant  
endocrinologist, The London  
Hospital (Chairman); Dr John  
B Randell, consultant psychiatrist,  
Charing Cross Hospital; Peter  
Byrne, moral philosopher and  
lecturer in the philosophy of  
religion, King's College, London

**Monday 25 April****NMG lecture: WHAT SHOULD  
WE DO ABOUT BAD DOCTORS?**

5.15 pm New Lecture Theatre,  
Royal Victoria Infirmary, Newcastle

Dr Donald Irvine, family  
doctor, Hon Sec RCGP,  
Member of Merrison Committee

**Tuesday 26 April****EMG symposium:****NURSES IN PRIMARY CARE**

5.15 pm West Lecture Theatre,  
Medical School, Teviot Place,  
Edinburgh

Sir John Brotherston, Chief  
Medical Officer; Miss L Hockey,  
Nursing Research Unit; Dr W J  
Bassett, Craigshill Health Centre;  
Mrs M McKay, Department of  
Social Work, Musselburgh

**Tuesday 26 April****LMG symposium:****TREATMENT BY PHONE-IN:****THE NEXT STEP BEFORE COMPUTERS**

5.45 pm Middlesex Hospital  
Medical School

Dr R D Catterall, Director,  
James Pringle House, Middlesex  
Hospital (Chairman); Dr Hugh  
Jolly, consultant paediatrician,  
Charing Cross Hospital; Anna  
Raeburn, journalist, *Woman*;  
Professor Eric Wilkes, Professor of  
Community Care and General  
Practice, Sheffield

**Monday 2 May****EMG lunch-time talk:**

**PSYCHIATRY I** pm Royal  
Edinburgh Hospital

Dr A W Clare, The Institute of  
Psychiatry, Maudsley Hospital

**Tuesday 3 May****CMG symposium: WHO'S HAVING  
THE BABY, THE MOTHER OR THE**

**OBSTETRICIAN?** 5.30 pm The Welsh  
National School of Medicine, Cardiff

Professor B Hibbard, Department  
of Obstetrics and Gynaecology,  
University Hospital of Wales;  
Professor P Huntingford,  
Department of Obstetrics and  
Gynaecology of The London  
Hospital and St Bartholomew's  
Hospital

**Tuesday 3 May****LMG symposium:****NEUROLOGICAL AND SOCIAL  
CONSEQUENCES OF HUNTINGTON'S  
CHOREA**

5.45 pm St Bartholomew's Hospital

Dr Patrick Cox, physician in  
charge, Department of Child  
Health, St Bartholomew's Hospital  
(Chairman); Professor Charles  
Marsden, Professor of Neurology,

Institute of Psychiatry; Dr Kenneth  
W G Heathfield, consultant  
neurologist, Whipps Cross Hospital;  
Dr Andrian Caro, Director,  
Huntington's Chorea Research  
Project

**Tuesday 3 May****LpMG lecture: PRIVATE MEDICINE—  
THE ALTERNATIVE HEALTH SERVICE?**

5.15 pm Medical Training Centre,  
Mount Vernon Street, Liverpool

The Right Hon Lord Taylor of  
Harlow

**Thursday 5 May****LMG symposium: FRINGE  
MEDICINE: CAN IT EVER BE PART  
OF THE NHS?**

6 pm St George's Hospital, Tooting

Professor A E Bennett,  
Professor of Clinical Epidemiology  
and Social Medicine, St George's  
Hospital (Chairman); Dr Ralph  
Twentyman, consultant physician,  
Royal London Homeopathic  
Hospital; Albert Rumfitt, Dean  
Emeritus, British College of  
Naturopathy and Osteopathy,  
London

**Thursday 5 May****BMG symposium: THE NURSE AS A  
LEARNER AND AS A TEACHER**

7.30 pm Bristol Royal Infirmary

Mr Cyril Frain (Chairman);  
Professor Reginald Revans,  
author of *Action Learning in  
Hospitals*; Dr Alison Tierney,  
lecturer, Department of Nursing  
Studies, Edinburgh University

**Monday 9 May****MMG lecture: REASSURANCE**

5.30 pm Stopford Building,  
Oxford Road, Manchester

Dr W I Neil Kessel, Professor  
of Psychiatry, University of  
Manchester

**Monday 9 May****EMG lunch-time talk:****CAN THE COMMUNITY CARE?**

1 pm Royal Edinburgh Hospital

Mr L Nauman, The Grassmarket  
Project; Dr J Basson, Royal  
Edinburgh Hospital

**Tuesday 10 May****LMG symposium:****WHO'S HAVING THE BABY: THE  
MOTHER OR THE OBSTETRICIAN?**

5.45 pm St Mary's Hospital  
Medical School

Professor Richard W Beard,  
Professor of Obstetrics and

## News and notes

### Two interesting conferences

Two interesting conferences have been arranged for the early summer by the Bristol Medical Group in conjunction with the Cardiff Medical Group and by the Sheffield Medical Group. Details follow.

#### COMMUNICATING WITH THE PATIENT

In conjunction with the Cardiff Medical Group the Bristol Medical Group has arranged a conference on 'Communicating with the patient'. The conference is on Saturday 23 April at Level 9, Lecture Theatre, Bristol Royal Infirmary.

Details can be obtained from Dr Christopher Lovell, Department of Medicine, Bristol Royal Infirmary, Bristol BS2 8HW. Please enclose stamped addressed envelope.

#### SPINA BIFIDA

A one-day conference has been

arranged by the Sheffield Medical Group on spina bifida in two main sessions: the first to discuss the present-day views on the handicap; and the second to discuss the consequences of the treatment in terms of education, family and social life. The conference will be held on Saturday 14 May at the New Medical School, Beech Road, Sheffield.

Further information from the Conference Convener, Sheffield Medical Group, c/o Department of Community Medicine, The New Medical School, Beech Hill Road, Sheffield.

Please enclose a stamped addressed envelope.

### Reprints

Although authors of papers published in the Journal are not offered reprints but copies of the Journal instead, reprints can always be obtained if authors write to the

Publisher, *Journal of medical ethics*, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR. The cost of reprints will be quoted and authors can than order accordingly.

### References

To bring the method of citing references into line with the practice common to most medical journals at the present time, the Harvard system will no longer be used but references will be indicated by a superior number in the text and listed numerically at the end of the article. In this issue the references are 'mixed' in the way in which they are set out as some papers were printed before it was decided to make the change.

### Lectures and symposia—continued

Gynaecology, St Mary's Hospital (Chairman); Mr V Bictor Lewis, consultant obstetrician and gynaecologist, Watford General Hospital; Sheila Kitzinger, childbirth educationist and social anthropologist

#### Wednesday 11 May

SMG lecture:

SPINA BIFIDA—AN INTRODUCTION  
5.30 pm New Medical School,  
Beech Road, Sheffield

Dr John Lorber

#### Thursday 12 May

LMG symposium: HAVE WE MADE ADOLESCENCE A DISEASE?  
5.45 pm St Thomas's Hospital  
Professor W I Cranston, Professor of Medicine, St Thomas's Hospital (Chairman); Dr Steven Wolkind, senior lecturer in psychiatry, The London Hospital Medical College; Moses Laufer, Director, Brent Consultation Centre for the Study of

Adolescence, author of *Adolescent Disturbance and Breakdown*

#### Monday 16 May

EMG lunch-time talk:

FAITH HEALING

1 pm Royal Edinburgh Hospital

Dr D Doyle, general practitioner;  
Dr G Strachan, The Netherbow;  
Dr P Kolman, Royal Edinburgh  
Hospital

#### Tuesday 17 May

LMG symposium:

TRANQUILLIZERS: TREATMENT OF  
PATIENT OR DOCTOR 5.45 pm  
University College Hospital  
Medical School

Professor Herbert A Brant, Professor of Clinical Obstetrics and Gynaecology, UCH (Chairman); Dr John Stevens, general practitioner, Aldeburgh; Dr J D Pollitt, physician in charge, Department of Psychological Medicine, St Thomas's Hospital

#### Thursday 26 May

LMG illustrated symposium:  
HOW HOPELESS ARE HOPELESS CASES?  
6.15 pm Westminster Medical  
School

Dr B G Boothroyd-Brooks, consultant child psychiatrist, Department of Child and Family Psychiatry, Westminster Children's Hospital (Chairman); Professor Ludwig Guttman, Director, Stoke Mandeville Sports Stadium for the Paralysed and other Disabled; Margaret C Bodington, Matron, Royal Hospital and Home for Incurables, Putney

#### Wednesday 15 June

BMG lecture:

THE LARGE TEACHING HOSPITAL—  
A DISASTER IN THE THIRD WORLD?  
7.30 pm Bristol Royal Infirmary  
Dr David Morley, Reader in  
Tropical Child Health, Institute of  
Child Health, London

**President** Lord Amulree

Director of Studies Edward Shotter

Scottish Director Kenneth Boyd

Honorary Assistant Director

Anthony Thorley

Treasurer Kenneth Darke

Chairman, Editorial Board

R B Welbourn

Editor, *Journal of medical ethics*

A V Campbell

Consulting Editors

A S Duncan C M Fletcher

Technical Editor Gunilla Liddle

Secretaries Penny Stewart

Helen Horton

**Governing Body**

Lord Amulree

*Chairman*

P S de Q Cabot

*Management consultant*

R D Catterall

*Consultant venereologist, Middlesex Hospital*

A S Duncan

*Emeritus Professor of Medical Education*

G R Dunstan

*Professor of Moral & Social Theology, King's College, London*

C D Falconer

*Scottish Secretary, British Medical Association*

C M Fletcher

*Emeritus Professor of Clinical Epidemiology*

T W A Glenister

*Dean and Professor of Anatomy, Charing Cross Hospital Medical School*

Sir Cyril Kleinwort

*Chairman, Finance and General Purposes Committee*

O M Lidwell

*Medical Research Council*

Dame Muriel Powell

*Formerly Chief Nursing Officer, Scottish Home & Health Department*

R B Welbourn

*Professor of Surgery, Royal Post-graduate Medical School*

Sir Brian Windeyer

*Formerly Vice-Chancellor, University of London*

Dorian Haskard

*Middlesex Hospital Medical School*

Paul Nunn

*University College Hospital Medical School*

Colin Ball

*St Thomas's Hospital Medical School*

Tim Helme

*Middlesex Hospital Medical School*

Edward Shotter

*Director of Studies ex officio*

# Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

The Society for the Study of Medical Ethics is an independent, non-partisan organization for the multidisciplinary study of issues raised by the practice of medicine.

The Society aims to influence the quality of both professional and public discussion of medico-moral questions; to promote the study of medical ethics; to ensure a high academic standard for this developing subject; to encourage a multidisciplinary approach to discussion of the consequences of clinical practice; to stimulate research in specific problems; to remain non-partisan and independent of all interest groups and lobbies.

Since 1963 the London Medical Group, a student group for the study of issues raised by the practice of medicine, has arranged a series of lectures and symposia, now twice weekly throughout the academic year, in the 12 London teaching hospitals and medical schools.

In 1967 the Edinburgh Medical Group was established with similar aims, and subsequently medical groups have been formed in a majority of the British medical schools—currently Newcastle, Sheffield, Glasgow, Bristol, Birmingham, Manchester, Liverpool and Cardiff.

In 1972 junior doctors, who had themselves been associated with the London Medical Group, founded the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics to develop these aims at a postgraduate level.

DOCUMENTATION in Medical Ethics, superseded as the organ of the Society by the *Journal of medical ethics*, is now produced as the proceedings of the annual conference held in conjunction with the London Medical Group.

In 1975 research fellows were appointed by the Edinburgh Medical Group which has established, in conjunction with the University of Edinburgh, a research project in medical ethics and education. This is funded by the Leverhulme Trust Fund and the Nuffield Provincial Hospitals Trust.

The Society for the Study of Medical Ethics is a registered educational charity and a Company Limited by Guarantee. It relies on voluntary grants and donations and is not supported from government sources.

There is no individual membership of the Society. Those interested in this work are invited to subscribe to the *Journal of medical ethics*. The lectures of the London Medical Group and the other associated medical groups, although addressed primarily to medical, nursing and other students, are open to all those professionally interested. There is no charge.

ADDRESS: Society for the Study of Medical Ethics  
Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London, WC1H 9LG.  
Tel: 01-387 8132