The journal of the Institute of Medical Ethics

The Journal of Medical Ethics was established in 1975, with a multidisciplinary editorial board, to promote the study of contemporary medico-moral problems. The editorial board has as its aims the encouragement of a high academic standard for this ever-developing subject and the enhancement of professional and public discussion. The journal is published quarterly and includes papers on all aspects of health care ethics, analyses ethical concepts and theories and features case conferences and comment on clinical practice. Intermittent series focus on the Teaching of medical ethics; on the medico-moral problems directly experienced by health care workers (At the coalface); on the pursuit of arguments prompted by papers in the journal (Debate); on medical ethics in literature (Medical ethics and literature); and on briefly argued often unorthodox opinions related to medical ethics (Point of view). The journal also contains book reviews and letters.

Editorial Board

EDITOR
Dr Raanan Gillon, general practitioner and philosopher, St Mary's Hospital Medical School/Imperial College, London University

CONSULTING EDITORS:
Sir Douglas Black, physician, Manchester University, UK
Professor Robin Downie, moral philosopher, Glasgow University, UK

CHAIRMAN, EDITORIAL BOARD:
Professor Thomas Opp, paediatrician, St Mary's Hospital Medical School, London UK

EDITORIAL ASSOCIATE:
Dr Anthony Hope, psychiatrist, leader, Oxford Practice Skills Project, Oxford University, UK
Dr Susan Beasley, obstetrician/gynaecologist, University College Hospital, London, UK
Dr Kenneth Boyd, historian, chaplain, University of Edinburgh, UK
Professor Margaret Brasier, medical lawyer, Manchester University, UK
Professor Els Borst-Eilers, physician, chair of National Health Ethics and Law Committee, The Hague, the Netherlands
Professor Anthony Culyer, medical economist, Pro-Vice Chancellor, University of York, UK
Dr Louise de Clercq, nurse, philosopher, University College, Swansea, UK
Professor John Haldane, philosopher, University of St Andrews, UK
Professor R M Hare, philosopher, Universities of Oxford, UK and Florida, USA
Professor John Harris, philosopher, Manchester University, UK
Professor Roger Higgs, general practitioner, and Head of Department of General Practice, King's College, London, UK
Professor Margot Jeffrey, medical sociologist, University of London, UK
Rabbi Julia Neuberger, Chair, Camden Community Health Council, London, UK
Dr Allyson Pollock, public health physician, St George's Hospital, London, UK
Professor Alan Pompidou, pathologist, member of European parliament, France
Dr Octavia Quintana, Chairman, Council of European Steering Committee for Bioethics, Madrid, Spain
The very reverend Edward Shottler, Dean of Rochester, Institute of Medical Ethics Amalienau Fellow, UK
Professor Robert Williamsson, molecular biochemist, St Mary's Hospital Medical School, Imperial College, London, UK

EX-OFFICIO:
Dr Richard Smith, editor, British Medical Journal, UK
Professor Richard West, postgraduate medical dean, Bristol University, UK; general secretary, Institute of Medical Ethics, UK

Editorial Advisory Board
Professor Karen Berg, physician, Chairman, Institute of Medical Genetics, University of Oslo, Norway
Dr Bela Blaszauer, medical lawyer, Medical University of Pecs, Hungary
Dr Meno; Martin Bojar, neurologist, Charles University, Prague, Czech Republic
Judge Christian Byk, medical lawyer and magistrate, Paris, France
Professor Alastair Campbell, theologian, Director, Centre for Bioethics, University of Otago, New Zealand

Notice to subscribers

The Journal of Medical Ethics is published quarterly. The annual subscription rate is £80.00 for all countries. However, the rate in the USA for subscribers who order directly from the publishers is $146, payable by cheque or the charge/credit cards listed below. Payment for all other subscriptions may be made by VISA, Mastercard, or American Express or by sterling cheque or draft drawn on a UK bank. All payments should be made to the British Medical Journal. Subscription orders may also be placed with any leading subscription agent or bookseller. For the convenience of readers in the USA, orders may be sent to the British Medical Journal, Box No 560B, Kennebunkport, Maine 04046. All other orders and enquires for airmail rates, single copy sales and advertising should be sent to British Medical Journal, BMA House, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR, United Kingdom. Contributors: See page 126.

ISSN 0306-6800

Copyright © 1994 Journal of Medical Ethics. All Rights Reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the Journal of Medical Ethics.
(10) Szasz T S. 'More cruel than the gas chamber'. New society 1971 Dec 16: 1213–1215.
(18) National Alliance for the Mentally Ill. NAMI members on employment. NAMI advocate 1992; 13: 3.
(21) Shakespeare W. Julius Caesar Act II, Sc 1, line 18.

---

**News and notes**

**Postgraduate opportunities**

Applications are invited by the Bioethics Research Centre, Otago Medical School for enrolment in the following postgraduate degrees: Master of Health Sciences, Doctor of Philosophy, Diploma for Graduates, Master of Medical Science and Bachelor of Medical Science. Coursework provides the foundation for a substantial thesis which can be theoretical or applied.

The closing date for these programmes is November 1. For information please write to: The Bioethics Research Centre, Otago Medical School, PO 913 Dunedin, New Zealand. Tel. (64 3) 474 7977.
Ann W Bird, MA Lond, BEd (Hons), Sister Tutor’s Dip, RCNT, RGN, is senior education manager and head of ethics unit, North West London College of Nursing and Midwifery, Praed Street, London.

References
(8) Aristotle. Nicomachean ethics. Bk II: ch VI.

News and notes
Ethical Issues in Health Care
A conference for all health professionals, Ethical Issues in Health Care, will be held at the University of Brighton on 21st and 22nd September this year.

The conference is designed to encourage dialogue on ethical issues in health care between health care professionals and educators from the fields of nursing, midwifery, medicine, physiotherapy and other professions allied to medicine.

Workshops will include: Ethical issues and communication; Teaching ethics to health professionals; Rationing of health care, and Patient/client choice.

For further details please contact: Jackie Lawrence: tel: 0892 823535 ext 3131; fax: 0892 823137.

Submitting manuscripts for publication
Papers submitted for publication should be sent in quadruplicate to: The Editor, Journal of Medical Ethics, c/o Imperial College of Science, Technology and Medicine, 14 Prince’s Gardens, London SW7 1NA. The journal considers papers only if they are not under consideration by any other journal at the same time. Rejected manuscripts are not returned. Papers should be in double-spaced typewriting on one side of the paper only. The preferred maximum length of papers is 3,500 words – absolute maximum 5,500 (including references). A total word count (including references) is requested. On a separate sheet some brief biographical details should be supplied, including the title of the author’s present post, degrees and/or professional qualifications (if any), and any other relevant information.

Two copies of the journal will be sent to authors free of charge after their papers are published. Offprints of individual papers may be bought from Journal of Medical Ethics, BMA House, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

In March 1981 the JME adopted a simplified ‘Vancouver style’ for references: details are given in various issues, including December 1990. They are also available from the editorial office. The full text of the ‘Vancouver Agreement’ was published in the British Medical Journal in 1988; volume 296; 401–405. As the ‘Vancouver style’ is incompatible with the long established style of references for legal articles, lawyers should use their own standard style, but try to facilitate reference by others. The journal is multidisciplinary and papers should be in clear jargon-free English, accessible to any intelligent reader.
(8) Lord Chief Justice Coleridge in R v Instan: 'It would not be correct to say that every moral obligation involves a legal duty; but every legal duty is founded on a moral obligation'. 1 QB 450, at 453.
(9) Saskatchewan regulation 331/79, s (16) (1) and (2) (e).
(10) Saskatchewan Local Authority Freedom of Information and Privacy Act 1990–1991: ch L-27.1; sections 23 (1) (c) and 28 (1) (k) (i) and (ii).

---

**News and notes**

**Wood Institute Research fellowships**


Established in 1787, the College of Physicians of Philadelphia is one of the oldest honorary, private medical academies in the United States. The resources of this not-for-profit institution include a renowned Library, the Mütter Museum and the Francis C Wood Institute for the History of Medicine. The Wood Institute fellowship programme enables scholars to spend time in residence at the college in order to use its library and museum. The fellowship programme is partially supported by the Women’s Committee of the College of Physicians, and supports research in the history of medicine.

The 1994 Scholar-in-Residence fellowship of the Wood Institute for the History of Medicine goes to Dr David M Cantor. Dr Cantor received his BA and PhD from the University of Lancaster, and is currently a Research Fellow in the Department of the History of Science, Medicine, and Technology at Johns Hopkins University. He will be researching Neo-Hippocratism in Inter-War British Medicine.

News and notes

Randomised controlled trials: ethical and legal issues

A two-day ethics course for doctors, nurses and members of research ethics committees to consider the ethical and legal implications of undertaking randomised controlled trials will be held at the British Postgraduate Medical Federation (BPMF) Central Office, 33 Millman Street, London WC1N 3EJ, on the 22nd and 23rd of November 1994.

Sessions covering the rationale and need for controlled trials, how they impinge on the doctor/patient relationship, and the ethical and legal considerations which result will be taken by Professor Michael Baum, Mrs Joan Houghton, Dr Lesley Fallowfield, Mrs Angela Hall, Dr Raanan Gillon, Mrs Claire Gilbert Foster and Mrs Diana Brahams. Each session will include a lecture and workshop or discussion time. Participants will be invited to present cases of particular interest for discussion.

The course is non-residential but information on accommodation can be provided.

In order to achieve an informal approach numbers will be limited, so early application is advisable.

The course fee is £198 and includes meals and refreshments. (PGEA approved: 12hrs Service Management.)

Further details and application forms are available from: Education Department, BPMF, 33 Millman Street, London WC1N 3EJ. Tel: 071-831 6222 ext 155 or 071-405 5660 (24hr answerphone). Fax: 071-831 1387.
The Institute of Medical Ethics: working parties and medical groups

Working parties

Each discussion paper was written on behalf of the relevant working party by the institute’s Research Director, Kenneth Boyd.

Medical groups

ABERDEEN MEDICAL GROUP
Dr M D McArthur, Department of Medicine for the Elderly, Wood End Hospital, Aberdeen AB9 2YS

BIRMINGHAM MEDICAL GROUP
Mr R Sawers, Birmingham Maternity Hospital, Queen Elizabeth Medical Centre, Edgbaston, Birmingham B15 2TG

BRISTOL MEDICAL GROUP
Dr Oliver Russell, Reader in Mental Health, Bristol University, Department of Mental Health, 41 St Michael’s Hill, Bristol BS2 8DZ

DUNDEE MEDICAL GROUP
Dr David B Walsh, Consultant in Biochemical Medicine, Ninewells Hospital, Dundee DD1 9SY

EDINBURGH MEDICAL GROUP
Dr Brian Chapman, Royal Infirmary of Edinburgh, Lauriston Place, Edinburgh EH3 9YW

GLASGOW MEDICAL GROUP
Dr E Hillan, Department of Nursing Studies, Glasgow University, Glasgow G12 8QQ

LEEDS MEDICAL GROUP
Mr Brian Bentley, Principal of the School of Radiography, General Infirmary, Belmont Grove, Leeds LS2 9NS

LEICESTER MEDICAL GROUP
Dr R K McKinley, Department of General Practice, University of Leicester, Leicester General Hospital, Gwendolen Road, Leicester LE5 4PW

LIVERPOOL MEDICAL GROUP
Dr Heath Draper, Lecturer in Health Promotion, Department of General Practice, Liverpool University, PO Box 147, Liverpool L69 3BX

LONDON
THE UNITED MEDICAL ETHICS GROUP (GUY’S AND ST THOMAS’S HOSPITALS)
Dr Graham Clayden, Reader in Paediatrics, St Thomas’s Hospital, Lambeth Palace Road, London SE1 7EH

THE ROYAL FREE ETHICS GROUPS
Dr Margaret Lloyd, Department of Public Health and Primary Care, The Royal Free Hospital School of Medicine, Pond Street, London NW3 2PF

ST GEORGE’S MEDICAL GROUP
Dr N Eastman, St George’s Hospital Medical School, London SW17 0RE

ST MARY’S HOSPITAL ETHICS FORUM
Jane Tessier-Denham, St Mary’s Hospital Ethics Forum, St Mary’s Hospital Medical School, Praed Street, London W2

MANCHESTER MEDICAL GROUP
Dr Geoffrey Jessup, 27 Oakwood Lane, Bowden, Altrincham, Cheshire WA14 3DL

NEWCASTLE MEDICAL GROUP
The Revd Bryan Vernon, Anglican Chaplain, Newcastle University, Department of Primary Health Care, School of Health Care Sciences, The Medical School, Framlington Place, Newcastle upon Tyne NE2 4HH

NOTTINGHAM MEDICAL ETHICS GROUP
Dr T C O’Dowd, Department of General Practice, University Hospital and Medical School, Clifton Boulevard, Nottingham NG7 2UH

SOUTHAMPTON MEDICAL GROUP
The Revd T Pinner, 8 Bassett Close, Southampton SO2 3FP

Medical groups associated with the Institute of Medical Ethics have been established in British university teaching hospitals. Each academic year they arrange programmes of lectures and symposia on issues raised by the practice of medicine which concern other disciplines. Although these programmes are addressed primarily to medical, nursing and other hospital students they are open to all members of the medical, nursing and allied professions. There is no fee for attendance. Lecture lists are available by direct application to the appropriate co-ordinating secretary named above. A stamped addressed A4 envelope would be appreciated.
SOCIETY OF APOTHECARIES OF LONDON

Diploma in the Philosophy of Medicine

The next course will start on Saturday 8 October 1994. Thereafter sessions will be held on alternate Saturday mornings until 1 July. The fee for the course is £250.

Details of the course are available from:
The Society of Apothecaries,
Apothecaries’ Hall, Black Friars Lane,
London EC4V 6EJ
Telephone 071 236 1180

---

ETHICAL ISSUES IN THE TREATMENT OF CHILDHOOD CANCER

Thursday 30 to Friday 31 March 1995
Parkway Hotel, Leeds

Contact: Phillipa Kemp
Yorkshire Regional Cancer Organisation
Cookridge Hospital
Leeds LS16 6QB
Telephone: (0532) 924403 (direct line)

---

THE ROYAL COLLEGE OF OBSTETRICIANS AND GYNAECOLOGISTS
Registered Charity No. 213289

ETHICS IN OBSTETRICS AND GYNAECOLOGY - FROM THEORY TO PRACTICE
30th November 1994

This meeting should be of interest to all postgraduate doctors. It will include talks on the practice of medical ethics, whether money should influence medical decisions, informed consent, the ethics of sex selection and problems of prenatal diagnosis.

Further details may be obtained from:
THE ROYAL COLLEGE OF OBSTETRICIANS AND GYNAECOLOGISTS
27 SUSSEX PLACE, REGENT’S PARK, LONDON NW1 4RG
Telephone: 071 262 5425/402 2317 extension 245
Institute of Medical Ethics

The Institute of Medical Ethics is an organisation for research, education and information in the broad area of health care ethics. It is financed by grants from charitable bodies, government sources and members’ subscriptions.

It was established as the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics, and is an independent, non-partisan organisation for the dispassionate multidisciplinary study of medico-moral issues raised by the practice of medicine.

The institute aims to help improve the quality of both professional and public discussion of medico-moral questions; to promote the study of medical ethics; to promote high academic standards for this ever developing subject; to encourage a multidisciplinary approach to discussion of the consequences of clinical practice; to stimulate research into specific problems, and to remain non-partisan and independent of all interest groups and lobbies.


The institute derives from the London Medical Group, a student group for the study of ethical issues raised by the practice of medicine which, beginning in 1963, arranged a comprehensive programme of lectures and symposia on such issues. Similar groups associated with the institute are now established in university teaching hospitals at Aberdeen, Birmingham, Bristol, Cambridge, Dundee, Edinburgh, Glasgow, Leeds, Leicester, Liverpool, London, Manchester, Newcastle and Southampton.

Published by the BMJ Publishing Group on behalf of the Institute of Medical Ethics and the British Medical Association. Typesetting by Bedford Typesetters Ltd, Bedford. Printed in Great Britain by Derry & Son Ltd, Nottingham. The Institute of Medical Ethics is a registered charity, No 261876.