

The Journal of the Institute of Medical Ethics

The *Journal of Medical Ethics* was established in 1975, with a multidisciplinary editorial board, to promote the study of contemporary medico-moral problems. The editorial board has as its aims the encouragement of a high academic standard for this developing subject and the influencing of the quality of both professional and public discussion. The journal is published quarterly and includes papers on all aspects of medical ethics, analyses ethical concepts and theories and features case conferences and comment on clinical practice. It also contains book reviews.

Editorial Board

EDITOR:

Raanan Gillon, BA (PHILOSOPHY), MB, BS, MRCP (UK). Director, Imperial College Health Service, University of London, and Visiting Professor, Centre of Medical Law and Ethics, King's College, University of London.

CONSULTING EDITORS:

Sir Douglas Black, Emeritus Professor of Medicine, Manchester University.

D W Hamlyn, Professor of Philosophy, Birkbeck College, London University.

EDITORIAL BOARD:

Thomas Oppé, Chairman: Professor of Paediatrics, St Mary's Hospital Medical School, London.

K M Boyd, Scottish Director, Institute of Medical Ethics, Edinburgh.

Alastair Campbell, Senior Lecturer, Department of Christian Ethics and Practical Theology, Edinburgh University.

A W Clare, Professor of Psychological Medicine, St Bartholomew's Hospital Medical College, London.

John Dawson, Head of Professional Division, British Medical Association, London.

Robin Downie, Professor of Moral Philosophy, Glasgow University.

A S Duncan, Emeritus Professor of Medical Education, Edinburgh University.

C M Fletcher, Emeritus Professor of Clinical Epidemiology, London University.

R M Hare, Professor of Moral Philosophy, University of Florida, Gainesville, USA.

Roger Higgs, Case conference editor, General Practitioner and Director of General Practice Studies, King's College School of Medicine and Dentistry, London.

Margot Jefferys, Emeritus Professor of Medical Sociology, University of London.

Ian Kennedy, Professor of Medical Law and Ethics, King's College, London.

Professor Sir Malcolm Macnaughton, Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Glasgow University

David Paterson, Executive Producer, Science and Features, BBC Television, London.

Sir Martin Roth, Professor of Psychiatry, Cambridge.

Royal Sells, Director, Renal Transplant Unit, Liverpool Royal Infirmary, Liverpool.

Elliot A Shinebourne, Consultant Paediatric Cardiologist, Brompton Hospital, London.

Paul Sieghart, Barrister, Gray's Inn, London.

Gerald Stern, Consultant Neurologist, University College Hospital, London.

Keith Ward, Professor of Moral and Social Theology, King's College, London.

R B Welbourn, Emeritus Professor of Surgical Endocrinology, Royal Postgraduate Medical School, London.

Eric Wilkes, Emeritus Professor of Community Care and General Practice, Sheffield University.

Professor Jennifer Wilson-Barnett, Department of Nursing Studies, King's College London (KQC), University of London.

Edward Shott, Director, Institute of Medical Ethics, *ex officio*.

Submitting manuscripts for publication

Papers submitted for publication should be sent in quadruplicate to: The Editor, *Journal of Medical Ethics*, 151 Great Portland Street, London W1N 5PB. Rejected manuscripts are not returned unless accompanied by a stamped addressed envelope, or international reply coupon. Papers should be in double-spaced typewriting on one side of the paper only. A total word count is appreciated. On a separate sheet some brief biographical details should be supplied, including the title of the author's present post, degrees and/or professional qualifications, (if any) and any other relevant information.

Four copies of the journal will be sent to authors free of charge after their papers are published. Offprints of individual papers may be bought from Professional and Scientific Publications, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

In March 1981 the *JME* adopted a simplified 'Vancouver style' for references: details are given in various issues, including December 1986. They are also available from the editorial office. The full text of the 'Vancouver Agreement' was published in the *British Medical Journal* in 1982; volume 284; 1766-70. As the 'Vancouver style' is incompatible with the long established style of references for legal articles, lawyers should use their own standard style, but try to facilitate reference by others. The journal is multidisciplinary and papers should be in clear jargon-free English, accessible to any intelligent reader.

Notice to subscribers

The *Journal of Medical Ethics* is published quarterly. The annual subscription rates are £35.00 in the United Kingdom and Irish Republic, and £53.00 in all countries overseas. US direct \$77.00. Payment for overseas subscriptions should be made in sterling, payable to Professional and Scientific Publications/JME A/c. Orders can also be placed locally with any leading subscription agent or bookseller. (For the convenience of readers in the USA subscription orders, with or without payment, can also be sent to: Professional and Scientific Publications, *British Medical Journal*, Box No 560B, Kennebunkport, Maine 04046. All enquiries, however, must be addressed to the publisher in London). All enquiries regarding air mail rates, single copies, advertisements, etc, should be sent to: Professional and Scientific Publications, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

ISSN 0306-6800

Copyright © 1988 *Journal of Medical Ethics*. All Rights Reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the *Journal of Medical Ethics*.

EDITORIAL ASSOCIATES:

Dr Anthony Hope, Oxford *Dr Simon Lundy*, London

TECHNICAL EDITOR:
Ann Lloyd, London.

EDITORIAL SECRETARY:
Maureen Bannatyne, London.

Thematic review and index

The thematic review of past issues appears in the June issue each year and an index to each volume appears in the December issue.

News and notes

Working party on organ transplantation in neonates

The Working Party on Organ Transplantation in Neonates which was set up by the Conference of Medical Royal Colleges and their faculties in the UK recommended that:

1. Organs for transplantation may be removed from anencephalic infants when two doctors who are not members of a transplant team agree that spontaneous respiration has ceased. In the adult the diagnosis of brain death plus apnoea is recognised as death. The working party felt by analogy that the absence of the forebrain in these infants plus apnoea would similarly be recognised as death. (para 4.7.4)
2. No pressure should be put upon parents to continue with a pregnancy solely in the interest of organ retrieval. (para 4.7.5)
3. In view of current uncertainties, organs for transplantation should not be removed within the first seven days of life from neonates with beating hearts even if they satisfy the brain stem death criteria which are used in older children and adults. This does not apply to anencephalic infants. (para 5.3)
4. It is unacceptable to transplant organs retrieved outside the UK unless the circumstances meet our own strict criteria. (para 6.1)
5. Neonatal organ transplantation should only be undertaken in a limited number of centres offering a full range of paediatric care. The results of these programmes should be reported to conference. (paras 6.2 and 6.3)
6. Long term follow-up of recipients will be required and a register of such patients is suggested. (para 6.4)
7. Further public and professional education concerning transplantation may be required. (para 6.5)

8. Conference should keep the subject of neonatal organ transplantation under review. (para 6.6)

The working party was established by conference at the request of the Department of Health and Social Security.

Re-launch for *IME Bulletin*

The Bulletin of the Institute of Medical Ethics – *IME Bulletin* – has been re-launched and now covers more subjects each month.

There are two principal additions to the usual coverage of news, official statements, journal articles, books etc: a review section looks in some depth, but not too academically, at recent developments in a particular field; and there is now a letters page.

The Bulletin is edited by Dr R H Nicholson at: IME Publications Ltd, 151 Great Portland Street, London W1N 5FB. Telephone: 01 580 5282

Call for abstracts

The Second International Conference on Health Law and Ethics, **London '89**, will be held at the University of London, from July 16–21 1989. The issues discussed will be: AIDS: medicine, law, public health strategies in industrialised and Third World countries; Malpractice, indemnity, risk management and litigation: strategies for prevention; Is there enough space in the medical lifeboat: should health care resources be rationed?; Life's end: hard choices; Law and mental competence; Conception and the biological revolution, and Medicine: compulsion and the State.

Abstracts of proposed papers related to these areas, of about 200-250 words, should be submitted to Lawrence O Gostin, JD, Co-chairman, London '89, American Society of Law & Medicine, 765 Commonwealth Avenue, Suite 1634, Boston MA 02215, USA. Telephone: (617) 262-4990.

London '89 is being organised by the American Society of Law and Medicine, the Commonwealth Lawyers' Association and the Commonwealth Medical Association.

Third International Congress on Ethics in Medicine

The Third International Congress on Ethics in Medicine will be held in Stockholm, Sweden from 13-15 September 1989. 'The individual versus society' is the overall theme of the congress. Under this heading the congress programme will centre on five main topics. These will cover 'classical' problems of medical ethics, such as those related to doctor responsibility, priorities in health care and research ethics, as well as issues such as those raised by high technology medicine, new methods for epidemiological research and the HIV infection.

The conference is being organised by the Karolinska Institute, Stockholm, the Beth Israel Medical Center, New York and the Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, Beersheba, Israel.

If you would like an invitation programme please write to the Congress Secretariat, Ethics in Medicine, c/o Congrex, PO Box 5619, S-11486 Stockholm, Sweden, saying at the same time whether you intend to submit a paper. Telephone: 4687234230.

of Damocles to contemplate a critical assessment of both oneself as the physician and as the patient being examined, the realisation of a dual fallibility leads not to an excuse to desist but to a new insight with refusal to

abandon responsibility to oneself or ethical medicine.

References

- (1) Freud S. *The psychopathology of*

everyday life. New York: W W Norton & Co, 1971: 154, 220, 229.

JOHN HENRY McWHORTER,
MD, MPH
McWhorter, WV 26401 USA

News and notes

Call for manuscripts

Brill's Studies in Epistemology, Psychology, and Psychiatry is devoted to the publication of recent philosophical works in these disciplines and, especially, in the areas in which these disciplines intersect. Such works may be of contemporary or historical interest, and of theoretical or practical significance. But they are related in their treatment of philosophical issues and problems pertaining to our understanding of the human mind, its acquisition, validation, and use of knowledge, and the conditions under which such acquisition, validation, and use are or should be regarded as rational.

Should you wish to submit a manuscript for this series, please write to: E J Brill, attention Elisabeth Erdman, POB 9000, 2300 PA Leiden, The Netherlands.

Notice for contributors to the Journal of Medical Ethics

Submitting manuscripts for publication

Four copies of papers submitted for publication should be sent to: The Editor, *Journal of Medical Ethics*, IME Publications, 151 Great Portland Street, London W1N 5PB. Rejected manuscripts are not returned unless accompanied by an adequately stamped addressed envelope, or international reply coupon. Papers, including references, should be in double-spaced typewriting on one side of the paper only. An approximate word-count is helpful. On a separate sheet brief details of the author's present post, an address for readers' correspondence and any other relevant information should be supplied.

The *JME* uses a simplified 'Vancouver style' for references. The full text of the 'Vancouver Agreement' was published in the *British medical journal* in 1982; Volume 284; 1766/1770. As the 'Vancouver style' is incompatible with the long established style of references for legal articles, lawyers should use their own standard style, but avoid abbreviations so as to facilitate reference by others. The journal is multidisciplinary and papers should be in clear jargon-free English, accessible to any intelligent reader.

Authors are asked to avoid footnotes wherever possible. Articles for the journal should be between 600 and 3500 words in length except book reviews which should be between 300 and 1200 words. Abbreviations should be avoided. The names of journals, organisations etc should be given in full.

Four copies of the journal will be sent to authors free of charge after their papers are published. Offprints of individual papers may be bought from Professional and Scientific Publications (JME), Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR.

Simplified 'Vancouver style'

All papers submitted for publication should contain the following:

- 1 On page one of the manuscript there should be:
 - a) the title of the article which should be concise but informative and designed to attract the reader. The Editor reserves the right to change titles to achieve these

ends.

- b) names, initials and academic degrees (if any) of author or authors right to change titles to achieve these ends.
- b) names, initials and academic degrees (if any) of author or authors
- c) names of department(s) and institution(s) to which the work should be attributed, if any
- d) disclaimers, if any
- e) source(s) of support, if any

2 On page two there should be:

- a) an *interesting* abstract or summary of not more than 150 words. Emphasise important and/or new aspects of the article to attract the potential reader
- b) key (indexing) terms – below the abstract. Provide and identify as such, three to six key words or short phrases that will assist indexers in cross-indexing your article and that may be published with the abstract.

Where appropriate, use terms from the Medical Subject Headings List from *INDEX Medicus*

3 Acknowledgements:

Acknowledge only persons who have made substantive contributions to the study. Authors are responsible for obtaining written permission from everyone acknowledged by name because readers may infer the latter's endorsement of data and conclusions.

4 References:

Number these consecutively in the order in which they are first mentioned in the text, tables, and captions, by arabic numerals (in parenthesis). The list of references at the end of the paper should be numbered in the order in which each reference appears in the text. Try to avoid using abstracts as references. 'Unpublished observations' and 'personal communications' may not be used as references, although references to written, not verbal, communications may be inserted (in parenthesis) in the text. Manuscripts accepted but not yet published may be used as references – designate the journal followed by 'in press' (in parenthesis). Information from manuscripts submitted but not accepted should be cited in the text as 'unpublished observations' (in parenthesis).

References must be verified by the author(s) against the original documents.

The following scheme, a simplification of the 'Vancouver style' for biomedical journals, should be followed for each reference: in the text – number (in parenthesis); in the list – author (list all authors if six or less; if seven or more, list only the first three and add '*et al*'), title, name of publication if different from title; place of publication and publisher (where appropriate); year of publication; and, where appropriate, volume, number and page references of article or chapter referred to. Examples of correct forms of reference are given below:

a) Standard journal article:

- (1) Paul E F, Paul J. Self-ownership, abortion and infanticide. *Journal of medical ethics* 1979; 5: 133-138.

b) Corporate author:

- (2) Conference of Royal Colleges and Faculties of the United Kingdom. Diagnosis of brain death. *Lancet* 1976; 2: 1060-1070.

c) No author given:

- (3) Anonymous. On telling dying patients the truth [editorial]. *Journal of medical ethics* 1982; 8: 117-119.

d) Personal author(s):

- (4) Hick J. *Death and eternal life*. Glasgow and London: Collins, 1976.

e) Editor, compiler, chairman as author:

- (5) Phillips CE, Wolfe JN, eds. *Clinical practice and economics*. Tunbridge Wells: Pitman Medical, 1977.

f) Chapter in book:

- (6) Armstrong C N. Intersexuality in man. In: Armstrong C N, Marshall A J, eds. *Intersexuality in vertebrates including man*. London: Academic Press, 1964: 349-352.

g) Agency publication:

- (7) The Linacre Centre for the Study of Ethics and Health Care. Paper 1: The principle of respect for human life. In: *Prolongation of life*. London: The Linacre Centre for the Study of Ethics and Health Care, 1978.

h) Newspaper article:

- (8) Dinwoodie R. Volunteers die as heart drug results baffle doctors. *The Scotsman* 1980 Sept 5: 11 (cols 1-6).

i) Magazine article:

- (9) James J. Homoeopathy – the treatment of like with like. *The Listener* 1980 Aug 21: 234-236.

Medical groups

ABERDEEN MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Elizabeth Russell, Department of Community Medicine, University of Aberdeen

BIRMINGHAM MEDICAL GROUP

Mr R Sawers, Birmingham Maternity Hospital, Queen Elizabeth Medical Centre, Edgbaston, Birmingham B15 2TG

BRISTOL MEDICAL GROUP

Julian C Hughes, Julian Pleydell-Pearce, 24 Kingsdown Parade, Cotham, Bristol, BS6 5UF

CAMBRIDGE MEDICAL GROUP

Mr Patrick Doyle, Department of Urology, Addenbrooke's Hospital, Hill's Road, Cambridge

DUNDEE MEDICAL GROUP

Dr David B Walsh, Consultant in Biochemical Medicine, Ninewells Hospital, Dundee

EDINBURGH MEDICAL GROUP

Mrs Maureen S Macmillan, Nursing Studies Research Unit, 12 Buccleuch Place, Edinburgh EH8

GLASGOW MEDICAL GROUP

Mr Harry Burns, Dept. of Surgery, Glasgow Royal Infirmary, Glasgow G4 0SF

LEEDS MEDICAL GROUP

Mr Bob Wright, Charge Nurse, 23 Woodhill Gardens, Leeds LS16 7DD

Dr Steve Conway, Registrar/Lecturer, Department of Paediatrics, Clarendon Wing, Leeds General Infirmary

LEICESTER MEDICAL GROUP

Professor Sidney Brandon, Department of Community Health, Clinical Sciences Building, Leicester Royal Infirmary, PO Box 65, Leicester LE2 7LX

Dr J S Rodgers, District Medical Officer, Kettering Health Authority, District Offices, Rothwell Road, Kettering, Northants NN16 8VZ

LIVERPOOL MEDICAL GROUP

Dr John Gosney, Department of Pathology, Royal Liverpool Hospital, Prescott Street, Liverpool 3

LONDON MEDICAL GROUP

Mrs Diana Cookson, Room 68, Tavistock House North, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9LG

MANCHESTER MEDICAL GROUP

Dr Andrew Proctor, University of Manchester, The Department of General Practice, Rusholme Health Centre, Walmer Street, Manchester M14 5NP

NEWCASTLE MEDICAL GROUP

Dr David Gregory, Department of Family and Community Medicine, The Medical School, Newcastle upon Tyne NE1 7RU

OXFORD MEDICAL FORUM

Dr Andrew Wood, MRC Clinical Pharmacology Unit, Oxford

SHEFFIELD MEDICAL GROUP

Mr David Watmough, Flat 3, 16 Beech Hill Road, Broomhill, Sheffield S10 2SB

SOUTHAMPTON MEDICAL GROUP

Dr R Grimble, Department of Nutrition, Medical and Biological Sciences Building, Bassett Crescent East, Bassett, Southampton SO9 3TU

Medical groups associated with the Institute of Medical Ethics have been established in British university teaching hospitals. Each academic year they arrange programmes of lectures and symposia on issues raised by the practice of medicine which concern other disciplines. Although these programmes are addressed primarily to medical, nursing and other hospital students they are open to all members of the medical, nursing and allied professions. There is no fee for attendance. Lecture lists are available by direct application to the appropriate co-ordinating secretary named above. A stamped addressed A4 envelope would be appreciated.

Institute of Medical Ethics

PRESIDENT

Sir Douglas Black, MD FRCP

VICE PRESIDENTS

Professor A S Duncan, DSc MB ChB FRCSE
FRCOG FRCPE MD (Hon)

Professor G R Dunstan, (Hon) DD (Hon) LLD
FSA

Professor R B Welbourn, MA MD (Hon) DSc
FRCS (Hon) FACS

GOVERNING BODY

R D Catterall, CBE FRCPE

Allan Chappell, CIPFA, (*Treasurer*)

Colin Currie, RD FRCP

Roger Higgs, MBE MA MB MRCP FRCGP

Professor Bryan Jennett, MD FRCS

Professor Ian Kennedy, LLM

David Layton, MBE MA

The Earl of Limerick, KBE MA CA

Stephen Lock, MA MB FRCP

Professor John Mahoney SJ, MA DD

Professor Thomas Oppé, CBE FRCP DCH
(*Chairman*)

A R Peacocke, MA DSc

Sir John Prideaux

Robert Sells, MA FRCS

Paul Sieghart

Richard West, MD FRCP DCH DObst RCOG

Jenifer Wilson-Barnett, SRN DipN BA MSc PhD
RNT FRCN

Director

Edward Shotter, BA

Scottish Director

Kenneth Boyd, MA BD PhD

Editor, Journal of Medical Ethics

Raanan Gillon, BA (Phil) MB BS MRCP

Editor, IME Bulletin

Richard Nicholson, MA BM DCH

Honorary Associate Directors

The Institute of Medical Ethics is a centre for research, education and information. It is financed by grants from charitable bodies, government sources and members' subscriptions.

It was established as the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics and is an independent, non-partisan organisation for the multidisciplinary study of medico-moral issues raised by the practice of medicine.

The institute aims to influence the quality of both professional and public discussion of medico-moral questions; to promote the study of medical ethics; to ensure a high academic standard for this developing subject; to encourage a multidisciplinary approach to discussion of the consequences of clinical practice; to stimulate research in specific problems, and to remain non-partisan and independent of all interest groups and lobbies.

The institute undertakes research on medico-moral questions, sponsors a major educational programme and provides an information service for members.

Two reports, *The Ethics of Resource Allocation in Health Care* by Kenneth Boyd and *Dilemmas of Dying* by Ian Thompson, were published, by the Edinburgh University Press, a few years ago.

In 1986 two more reports were published. One, on the ethics of clinical research investigations on children, *Medical Research with Children: Ethics, Law and Practice* by Richard Nicholson was published by the Oxford University Press and *Life Before Birth – the Search for a Consensus on Abortion and the Treatment of Infertility* by Kenneth Boyd, Brendan Callaghan and Edward Shotter, was published by SPCK. The *Pond Report on Teaching Medical Ethics*, a summary of which appeared in the IME Bulletin, was published in full last year.

The institute derives from the London Medical Group, a student group for the study of issues raised by the practice of medicine which, since 1963, has arranged a comprehensive programme of lectures and symposia on medico-moral issues raised by the practice of medicine. Similar groups associated with the institute have been established in university teaching hospitals at Aberdeen, Birmingham, Bristol, Cambridge, Cardiff, Dundee, Edinburgh, Glasgow, Leeds, Leicester, Liverpool, Manchester, Newcastle, Oxford, Sheffield and Southampton.

Membership of the institute is open to all those who work in the medical and allied professions or who have an interest in medical ethics. Members receive a monthly briefing on current developments, the Bulletin of the IME. The quarterly *Journal of Medical Ethics* is available by separate subscription.

Institute of Medical Ethics
Tavistock House North,
Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9LG

IME Publications
151 Great Portland Street
London W1N 5FB

Tel: 01-387 8132

Tel: 01-580 5282