

Journal of medical ethics

MAR 5 1976

**The Journal of the
Society for the Study of Medical Ethics**

Editor

A V Campbell

Consulting Editors

A S Duncan

C M Fletcher

Editorial Board

R B Welbourn (Chairman)

J C Blackie

Patrick Byrne

R Y Calne

R D Catterall

J Dominian

G R Dunstan

Roger Higgs

Lord Kilbrandon

Gordon Horobin

W S Peart

Raymond Plant

Dame Muriel Powell

Anthony Thorley

Sir Martin Roth

Cicely Saunders

Tony Smith

Edward Shotter

Technical Editor

Gunilla Liddle

Contents

109 Editorial

Main articles

111 Injuries to unborn children: Extracts from the report of the Law Commission

116 A critique of the Law Commission's report on injuries to unborn children and the proposed Congenital Disabilities (Civil Liability) Bill
Ian Kennedy and R G Edwards

122 Induced abortion: Epidemiological aspects
Sir Dugald Baird

127 A new ethical approach to abortion and its implications for the euthanasia dispute
R F R Gardner

132 Self medication with mood-changing drugs
D G Grahame-Smith

138 Some observations on informed consent in non-therapeutic research
J C Garnham

Case conference

146 The limits of informed consent

K Davison Ashley Robin J C Blackie

Analysis

150 An introduction to ethical concepts 'Is' and 'ought'
Patrick McGrath

152 Correspondence

155 Book review

156 Lectures for the autumn

159 News and notes

Book review

Medical Experimentation: Personal Integrity and Social Policy. Clinical Studies, vol 5. Charles Fried. Edited by A G Bearn, New York, D A K Black, London, and H H Hiatt, Boston. Publisher: North Holland Publishing Company, Amsterdam and Oxford. Elsevier Publishing Co. Incorporated, New York. Pp 172 excluding index, 177 including index.

Professor Fried has presented certain aspects of human medical experimentation very lucidly and logically in this book. As he acknowledges in the course of the essay, most aspects of human experimentation have been widely discussed by authors before him, but your reviewer has found it fascinating to see how a legal expert comes to grips with the moral, social and practical aspects of human experimentation. He stresses the cardinal feature of the inviolability of human rights, and emphasizes beyond doubt the significance of free and informed consent. He has argued the case for and against the

basic dilemma of many doctors and scientists, between research that has direct diagnostic or therapeutic benefit to the patient or individual as opposed to research that benefits the community at large with minimal benefit to the individual.

The main argument is based on the merits, demerits and limitations of randomized clinical trials. (I presume that Professor Fried accepts that progress in medicine is desirable and necessary.) Why he has concentrated on the nature and implications of the randomized clinical trial is because of the claims that a randomized clinical trial is the best and only scientific way of evaluating new or old therapies but he does not mention the ethical dilemmas in experiments on human subjects, notably the biological and genetic.

The author has refrained from commenting upon the ethical problems pertaining to minors, mentally subnormal or disordered persons. I am sure that an author of Professor Fried's vision could have given clearer legal guidance on the ethics

of experiments on minors and subnormal subjects. This is an aspect of human experimentation that requires urgent appraisal.

Finally I must return to Professor Fried's introduction where he states that: 'It is striking that much of what concerns us has not been dealt with directly in court decisions or legal codes, although some quasi-legal sources like the Nuremberg Code and the Declaration of Helsinki and some administrative material, official bodies like the Department of Health, Education and Welfare Policy on Protection of Human Subjects come closer.' In Britain the situation is very much the same, as the Medical Research Council and the Royal College of Physicians, London, have formulated codes of practice on the ethics of human experimentation. These codes widely accept the basic formulations on ethics as laid down by the Declaration of Geneva of the World Medical Association.

S M RAJAH

Contents of Volume 1, Number 2, 1975

The second number of the Journal contains the following:

Our future inheritance
R V Short

Transplantation
R Y Calne

Tissue for transplantation
Tam Dalyell, MP

The donor doctor's dilemma
Bryan Jennett

Ethical aspects of donor consent in transplantation
John Mahoney

Copies can be obtained from the publisher, *Journal of medical ethics*, Tavistock House East, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9JR

Transplantation: The relatives' view
Priscilla Demetrius
The parents of John

The medicalization of life
Ivan Illich

Clinical damage, medical monopoly the expropriation of health:
Three dimensions of iatrogenic tort
Ivan Illich

Why make people patients?
Marshall Marinker

Society's expectations of health
Edmund Leach

Commentary on 'The medicalization of life' and 'Society's expectations of health'
G Horobin

Not quite what the patient ordered
Katharine Whitehorn

The teaching of medical ethics
Clarence Blomquist
Robert M Veatch and
Diane Fenner

Analysis
The greatest happiness
Raymond Plant

Lecture lists for the autumn

London Medical Group

The following list sets out the open lectures and symposia for the autumn of 1975 (October to December). These are addressed primarily to medical students, junior hospital doctors and nurses but are open to students and others professionally interested.

Lectures and symposia are always followed by discussion, primarily for students

Symposium Abortion: The moral dilemma

6 PM TUESDAY 7 OCTOBER 1975,
CHARING CROSS HOSPITAL, FULHAM

Chairman Professor Norman Morris, MD, FRCOG, Dean, Faculty of Medicine.

Professor Hugh McLaren, MD, FRCP, FRCS, FRCOG, Professor of Obstetrics & Gynaecology, University of Birmingham.

Professor Peter Huntingford, MD, FRCOG, Professor of Obstetrics & Gynaecology, The London Hospital Medical College and St. Bartholomew's Hospital.

Jonathan Glover, MA, D Phil, tutor in philosophy, New College, Oxford.

Symposium Nurses working under stress

5.45 PM THURSDAY 9 OCTOBER 1975,
GUY'S HOSPITAL MEDICAL SCHOOL

Chairman Brysson Whyte, SRN, SCM, RNT, Director of Nurse Education, Guy's Hospital School of Nursing

Sarah MacMillan, SRN, St. George's Hospital

Michael Pritchard, MRCP, FRCPsych, Senior Lecturer, Department of Psychiatry, St. Thomas's Hospital

Myra Ross, RGN, SCM, RNT, nurse tutor, Nightingale School, St. Thomas's Hospital, formerly sister, coronary care unit, Royal Infirmary, Edinburgh

Symposium The misuse of psychiatry in the Soviet Union

5.45 PM TUESDAY 14 OCTOBER 1975,
KING'S COLLEGE HOSPITAL MEDICAL SCHOOL

Chairman John T Hutchinson, MD, FRCPsych, consultant psychiatrist, King's College Hospital

Peter Reddaway, MA, Senior Lecturer in Russian Politics, London School of Economics
Professor John Wing, MD, PhD, Professor of Social Psychiatry, MRC Social Psychiatry Unit, adviser to the DHSS

Symposium Rape

5.45 PM THURSDAY 16 OCTOBER 1975,
ST THOMAS'S HOSPITAL

Chairman Hugh R M Johnson, FRCPsych, Reader in Forensic Medicine, St. Thomas's Hospital Medical School

The Hon Mr Justice Park, Judge of the Family Division

Professor J M Cameron, MD, PhD, MRCPsych, DMJ(Path), Professor of Forensic Medicine, University of London, The London Hospital Medical College

Symposium Exorcism

5.45 PM TUESDAY 21 OCTOBER 1975,
MIDDLESEX HOSPITAL MEDICAL SCHOOL

Chairman Philip Boyd, MB, BS, MRCPsych, Psychiatrist-in-Charge, St Luke's Woodside Hospital

Professor William H Trethowan, MB, FRCP, FRACP, FRCPsych, DPM, Professor of Psychiatry, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, University of Birmingham
Chancellor E Garth Moore, MA, Fellow of Corpus Christi College, Cambridge, priest and lawyer

Illustrated lecture The nature and management of terminal pain

5.45 PM THURSDAY 23 OCTOBER 1975, ROYAL FREE HOSPITAL, HAMPSTEAD

Cicely Saunders, OBE, FRCP, Medical Director, St Christopher's Hospice

Symposium Touch: Its clinical and social significance

5.45 PM TUESDAY 28 OCTOBER 1975,
ST BARTHOLOMEW'S HOSPITAL

Chairman Patrick Cox, FRCP, consultant paediatrician, St Bartholomew's Hospital
Heinz H O Wolff, MD, FRCP, FRCPsych, consultant psychiatrist, University College Hospital and Maudsley Hospital
Colin James, MPhil, MRCP, MRCPsych, consultant psychiatrist, The London Hospital

Symposium Battered wives

6 PM THURSDAY 30 OCTOBER 1975,
ST GEORGE'S HOSPITAL, TOOTING

Chairman Professor Arthur Crisp, MD, FRCP(E), FRCPsych, Professor of Psychiatry, St George's Hospital
The Hon Mr Justice Arnold, Judge of the Family Division
Peter Scott, CBE, FRCP, FRCPsych, consulting forensic psychiatrist, Maudsley Hospital
Erin Pizzey, Chairman, Women's Aid, author of *Don't scream or the neighbours will hear*

Symposium Madness and society

5.45 PM TUESDAY 4 NOVEMBER 1975,
ST MARY'S HOSPITAL MEDICAL SCHOOL

Chairman Professor Michael Shepherd, FRCP, FRCPsych, Professor of Psychiatry, Institute of Psychiatry
Murray Last, PhD, Department of Anthropology, University College, London
Vieda Skultans, BA, PhD, lecturer in mental health, University of Bristol

Symposium Pornography and violence: Medical and social consequences

5.45 PM THURSDAY 6 NOVEMBER 1975
THE LONDON HOSPITAL MEDICAL COLLEGE

Chairman Patrick H Tooley, MD, FRCP, FRCPsych, consultant psychiatrist, The London Hospital
Mary Whitehouse, Honorary General Secretary, National Viewers' and Listeners' Association
A Hyatt Williams, MD, FRCPsych, DPM, consultant psychiatrist, Chairman, Adolescent Department, Tavistock Clinic

Symposium Incest: Its incidence and implications

5.45 PM TUESDAY 11 NOVEMBER 1975, MIDDLESEX HOSPITAL MEDICAL SCHOOL

Chairman R D Catterall, FRCPE, MRCS, Director, James Pringle House, Middlesex Hospital
Robert Buglass, MRCPsych, consultant forensic psychiatrist, All Saints' Hospital, Birmingham
Pauline Crabbe, OBE, JP, Brook Advisory Centre

Symposium Human guinea pigs: The influence of ethical committees on research

6.15 PM THURSDAY 13 NOVEMBER 1975, WESTMINSTER MEDICAL SCHOOL

Chairman P D Trevor Roper, MD, FRCS, consultant ophthalmologist, Westminster Hospital
M H Pappworth, MD, MRCP, consultant physician, author of *Human guinea pigs*
John S Garrow, PhD, MB, ChB, MRCP, consultant physician, Clinical Research Centre, Northwick Park Hospital

Lecture Patient power: Constructive criticism from the consumer

6 PM TUESDAY 18 NOVEMBER 1975, CHARING CROSS HOSPITAL, FULHAM
Jean Robinson, Chairman, Patients Association

Symposium Induced child-birth: In whose interest?

5.45 PM THURSDAY 20 NOVEMBER 1975 GUY'S HOSPITAL MEDICAL SCHOOL

Chairman E David Morris, MD, FRCS, FRCOG, consultant obstetrician & gynaecologist, Guy's Hospital

Professor Peter Huntingford, MD, FRCOG, Professor of Obstetrics & Gynaecology, The London Hospital Medical College and St Bartholomew's Hospital
Stanley C Simmons, FRCS, FRCOG, consultant obstetrician & gynaecologist, Windsor Group of Hospitals

Symposium The bereaved child and its parents

5.45 PM TUESDAY 25 NOVEMBER 1975, KING'S COLLEGE HOSPITAL MEDICAL SCHOOL

Chairman Professor Eric Stroud, BSc, FRCP, DCH, Professor and Director, Department of Child Health, King's College Hospital
Dora Black, MB, ChB, MRCPsych, DPM, child psychiatrist, Edgware General Hospital
Audrey Davey, SRN, SCN, HVCert, family case worker, Aberfan

Symposium Injuries to the unborn child

5.45 PM THURSDAY 27 NOVEMBER 1975, THE LONDON HOSPITAL MEDICAL COLLEGE

Chairman Professor C B S Wood, MA, MB, BChir, FRCP, DCH, Professor of Paediatrics, The London Hospital Medical College
Ian Kennedy, LL.M, Faculty of Law, King's College, London
R G Edwards, MA, DSc, PhD, Physiological Laboratory, Cambridge
Kenneth Holt, MD, FRCP, DCH, Director, Wolfson Centre, Institute of Child Health

Symposium The ethics of industrial action in the health service

5.45 PM TUESDAY 2 DECEMBER 1975, UNIVERSITY COLLEGE HOSPITAL MEDICAL SCHOOL

Chairman John Stokes, MA, MD, FRCP, physician, University College Hospital
Derek Stevenson, CBE, LL.D, MRCS, LRCP, General Secretary, British Medical Association
Professor Ian McColl, MS, FRCS, Professor of Surgery, Guy's Hospital

Symposium Doctors and torture

5.45 PM THURSDAY 4 DECEMBER 1975, ROYAL FREE HOSPITAL, HAMPSTEAD

Chairman Michael O'Donnell, MB, BChir, Editor, *World Medicine*
The Revd Paul Oestreicher, MA, Chairman, British Section, Amnesty International
Tim Shallise, PhD, member of British Society for Social Responsibility in Science, neuro-psychologist, National Hospital for Nervous Diseases, Queen's Square
James Mackeith, MA, MB, BCh, MRCPsych, DPM, consultant psychiatrist, Broadmoor Hospital

Edinburgh Medical Group

Lectures are held in the West Lecture Theatre of the Medical School, and the day conference will be at the University Health Centre

Symposium Research: The right to no

MONDAY 20 OCTOBER 5.15 PM
Professor A P M Forrest
Mr D M Ross
Mr D McIntosh

Lecture Rape

MONDAY 3 NOVEMBER 5.15 PM
Professor J K Mason

Half-day conference

Homosexuality and medicine
SATURDAY 22 NOVEMBER 9.30 AM-1 PM

Professor R E Kendell
Dr I B Tait
Dr K M Boyd

Symposium Public accountability and the General Medical Council

MONDAY 1 DECEMBER, 5.15 PM
Mr N G C Hendry
Mr I MacDonald
Professor A S Duncan

Bristol Medical Group

Only one meeting has been arranged for the autumn. Those arranged for the spring term will be published in the next issue

NOVEMBER

Homosexuality - a gay view?

Ray Lightbown (clinical psychologist)
Dr G Stephens (psychiatrist, Glenside Hospital, Bristol)

Manchester Medical Group

Further information can be obtained from the secretary

Transplantation ethics Life in death

13 OCTOBER

Chairman Professor M Irving,
Professor of Surgery, Hope
Hospital, Salford
Mr R W G Johnson, consultant
surgeon, Manchester Royal
Infirmary

Treatment behind bars

10 NOVEMBER 1975

Chairman Mr J Bamber,
Stipendiary Magistrate, City
Magistrates Court, Manchester
Dr A A Campbell, consultant
forensic psychiatrist, Prestwich
Hospital, Manchester

Education for sex

15 DECEMBER 1975

Chairman Dr C Duddle, The
Student Health Centre,
University of Manchester
Professor K J Dennis, Professor
of Human Reproduction and
Obstetrics, University of
Southampton

Sheffield Medical Group

Lecture Ethical problems of geriatric medicine

TUESDAY 28 OCTOBER, NEW MEDICAL
SCHOOL, BEECH HILL ROAD

J N Agate, MA, MD, FRCP,
consultant in geriatric medicine,
Ipswich & East Suffolk Hospital

Lecture What is medical ethics?

TUESDAY 11 NOVEMBER, NEW MEDICAL
SCHOOL, BEECH HILL ROAD

Alastair V Campbell, MA, BD,
ThD, Department of Christian
Ethics, New College, Edinburgh

Newcastle Medical Group

Further information will be posted on notice boards

Lecture Pharmaceutical companies and their advertising

FRIDAY 31 OCTOBER

G R Daniel, Medical Director
of E R Squibb & Sons Ltd, and
Dr D M Davies, Clinical
Pharmacologist, Shotley Bridge
Hospital

FRIDAY 28 NOVEMBER

Lecture Hypnosis

Dr G J F Briggs, consultant
psychiatrist, Winwick Hospital

Glasgow Medical Group

Further information will be posted on notice boards

THURSDAY 23 OCTOBER

Lecture Glasgow's Down and Outs

Campbell Robertson of the Iona
Community
Dr Patel, casualty officer
Dr Ker, Glasgow general
practitioner

THURSDAY 20 NOVEMBER

Lecture Live organs from dead bodies

Fr J Mahoney, Heythrop
College, London University
Dr Briggs, surgeon

News and notes

Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

DOCUMENTATION IN MEDICAL ETHICS

The Society publishes in addition to the *Journal of medical ethics* an occasional folder of articles already published in both medical and lay journals. *Documentation 5* is devoted to euthanasia and is available to Associates of the Society at the reduced rate of £1 per copy (inclusive of postage) or £2 overseas. *Documentation* may be purchased by others for £2.50 a copy; overseas £3.50 (inclusive of postage).

LECTURES AND SYMPOSIA

Associated with the Society are the following medical groups which arrange lectures and symposia in the medical schools and hospitals. These are addressed primarily to medical and nursing students and are open to others with a professional interest. The choice of topics is based on a student critique of the previous lectures and symposia and of the academic curriculum. The names of student officers are listed below together with an address from which further information is available.

Details of the autumn lectures and symposia are published on pages 156-158.

London Medical Group

President: John Sedgwick (St Thomas's Hospital)
Treasurer: Elizabeth Munro (Royal Free Hospital)
Secretary: Mark Papouchado (Charing Cross Hospital)
Director of Studies, London Medical Group, Tavistock House East, Woburn Walk, WC1H 9LG (01-387 8132)

Edinburgh Medical Group

Chairman: Myra Brown
Treasurer: Brian Potter
Secretary: Claire Metcalf
Publicity: Gordon Wright
Dr Kenneth Boyd, 1 Doune Terrace, Edinburgh EH3 6DY (031-225 6485)

Newcastle Medical Group

Chairman: Alison Leeder
Treasurer: Ann Barnby
Secretary: Stephen Townsend
Dr Roger Bolas, Department of Family and Community Medicine, University of Newcastle, 23 St Thomas Street, Newcastle-upon-Tyne. NE7 7RN (0632-883053)

Sheffield Medical Group

President: Rosemary Lennard
Vice-Presidents: Andrew Auckland and Peter Brown
Treasurer: Michael Rees
Dr Martin Hayes-Allen, 183 Whitham Road, Broomhill, Sheffield S10 2SN (0742 665902)

Glasgow Medical Group

President: Clare Garland
Conveners: James Grant, Colin Miller, Suhail Shehade
Dr John Dagg, Department of Medicine, Gardiner Institute, Western Infirmary, Glasgow G11 6NT (041-339 8822)

Bristol Medical Group

Treasurer: Michael Webb
Seminar Secretaries: Andrew Horne and Richard Sarginson
Publicity: Jack Czauderna
Dr Peter Wilkinson, Department of Medical Microbiology, Bristol Royal Infirmary, Bristol BS2 8HW (0272-22041 Ext. 2568)

NEW MEDICAL GROUPS

Medical groups are being established in Birmingham, Manchester, Liverpool and Cardiff. Further information from the Director of Studies of the Society, who is willing to advise on the formation of such groups elsewhere.

FURTHER INFORMATION

The Society maintains a secretariat at Tavistock House East, Woburn Walk, London WC1H 9LG 01-378 8132

The Society, which is non-partisan and independent of all medical, political, religious or social interest groups, has a multidisciplinary staff: Director of Studies: The Revd Edward F Shotter, BA
Assistant Director: Dr Anthony Thorley, MA, MB, MRCPsych
Secretaries: Miss Penny Stewart, SRN, and Mrs Helen Horton

Medicine and society forum, University of California, Los Angeles

This monthly forum was inaugurated in January 1974 with the aid of a grant from the Institute on Human Values in Medicine. It is currently supported by the University of California, Los Angeles (UCLA) School of Medicine and its Aesculapian Society, the UCLA Committee on Public Lectures and the UCLA Media Center. It is convened and the chair is taken by Bernard Towers, Professor of Pediatrics and Anatomy. These tightly structured discussions are recorded on videotape, and the tapes may be viewed in the Biomedical Library or borrowed for private or classroom study. Accompanying each tape is an outline of the subject matter for discussion (usually a clinical case history) and a list of references to the literature. The meetings are open to all, and time is reserved before the end of the hour for questions and comments from members of the audience.

The topics chosen to make up the programme for the academic year 1974-75 are in general those also chosen by the medical groups in Britain but an important difference is that they are widely advertised throughout the university, and there is no suggestion that the audience is envisaged as being mainly confined to medical students, nurses and sociology students. The programme is in fact concerned with 'medical' and social problems but it is assumed that all students are

interested and may be affected: indeed the programme and the speakers are very much a reflection of the interests of the readers of this Journal and its contributors – doctors, nurses, social scientists, lawyers, philosophers. It is not possible to print the whole of the list but topics include: *Would you let a nurse practitioner or physician's assistant take care of your best friend? Private rights and public health; Kidney failure and haemodialysis: Should everyone be treated? Intrauterine diagnosis in early pregnancy: fetal, parental and societal considerations; Sterilization before reproduction: the right to choose; The battered child syndrome.*

'New titles in bioethics'

The Kennedy Institute, Georgetown University, Washington, DC, has developed a new service for librarians and individual scholars. Each month subscribers to *New titles in bioethics* will receive a list of books, government documents, pamphlets, serial titles and audiovisual aids acquired during the previous four weeks by the Center for Bioethics Library of the Kennedy Institute.

The Bioethics Library, in cooperation with the information retrieval project currently in progress at the Institute, seeks to secure a copy of every new document published in the field of bioethics, and *New titles in bioethics* will

provide a regular, up-to-date survey of the part of that literature which is most difficult to control bibliographically – books and other separate publications.

The cost of this new 'current-awareness' service is \$6.00 per year, which covers duplicating and postage.

Further information may be obtained from the Librarian, Center for Bioethics, The Joseph and Rose Kennedy Institute, Georgetown University, Washington DC 20007, USA.