

Journal of medical ethics

**The Journal of the
Society for the Study of Medical Ethics**

Volume One 1975

Editor

A V Campbell

Consulting Editors

A S Duncan

C M Fletcher

Editorial Board

R B Welbourn (Chairman)

J C Blackie

Patrick Byrne

R Y Calne

R D Catterall

J Dominian

G R Dunstan

Roger Higgs

Lord Kilbrandon

Gordon Horobin

W S Peart

Raymond Plant

Dame Muriel Powell

Anthony Thorley

Sir Martin Roth

Cicely Saunders

Tony Smith

Edward Shotter

Technical Editor

Gunilla Liddle

Society for the Study of Medical Ethics,
Tavistock Square, London WC1

Journal of medical ethics

**The Journal of the
Society for the Study of Medical Ethics**

Editor
A V Campbell

Consulting Editors
A S Duncan
C M Fletcher

Editorial Board
R B Welbourn (Chairman)
J C Blackie
Patrick Byrne
R Y Calne
R D Catterall
J Dominian
G R Dunstan
Roger Higgs
Lord Kilbrandon
Gordon Horobin
W S Peart
Raymond Plant
Dame Muriel Powell
Anthony Thorley
Sir Martin Roth
Cicely Saunders
Edward Shotter

Technical Editor
Gunilla Liddle

Contents

Editorial	I
Ethics and the professions	2-4
<i>Lord Kilbrandon P D Nuttall Zofia Butrym</i>	
Should the patient be allowed to die?	5-9
<i>Richard Nicholson</i>	
The use of narcotic analgesics in terminal illness	10-17
<i>R G Twycross</i>	
Communicating with the dying	18-21
<i>Michael Wilson</i>	
<i>Commentary: C M Fletcher</i>	21-22
Composition and function of ethical committees	23-29
<i>William May</i>	
Donor insemination	30-33
<i>M G Kerr and Carol Rogers</i>	
Problems of selecting donors for artificial insemination	34-35
<i>R Schoysman</i>	
Cryobanking of human sperm	36-38
<i>Mark Frankel</i>	
AID and the law	39-41
<i>Douglas Cusine</i>	
Ethical aspects of donor insemination	42-44
<i>G R Dunstan</i>	
Case conference	45-48
<i>Abortion and sterilization</i>	
<i>Sir Dugald Baird Hugh McLaren J E Roberts</i>	
Analysis	49-50
<i>Determinism</i>	
<i>R S Downie</i>	
Guide to the literature	51-52
News and notes	53-54

News and notes

Society for the Study of Medical Ethics

ELECTION OF PRESIDENT

The Rt Hon Lord Amulree, MD FRCP FRCP, was elected first President of the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics, at the last meeting of the Governing Body of the Society.

MEMBERSHIP OF THE GOVERNING BODY

The following are members for 1974/75: *Chairman*: The Rt Hon Lord Amulree, MD FRCP FRCP, *President*. Professor J C Blackie, MA BD STM, *Chairman EMG Consultative Council*. P S de Q Cabot, MA PHD FBPS. R D Catterall, FRCPE MRCS, *Chairman LMG Consultative Council*. Kenneth Darke, MA FCA, *Senior Treasurer*. Professor A S Duncan, DSC MB ChB FRCSE FRCOG FRCPE, *Vice-Chairman EMG Consultative Council*. Professor the Revd Canon G R Dunstan, MA FSA DD. C D Falconer, MB FRCS(Ed). Professor C M Fletcher, CBE MD FRCP. Professor A P M Forrest, BSC, MD ChM FRCS(Ed). Professor T W A Glenister, TD, DSC MB BS. Sir George Godber, GCB DM FRCP FRCOG. Ernest Kleinwort, *Chairman Finance and General Purposes Committee*. O M Lidwell, DPhil. Elizabeth Munro, *Junior Treasurer LMG*. Mark Papouchado, BA, *Secretary LMG Representative Council*. Professor W S Peart, FSA MD FRCP, Dame Muriel Powell, DBE SRN SCM, John Sedgwick, MA, *President LMG*. Simon Walford, BA MB BChir, *Past President LMG*. Professor R B Welbourn, MA MD FRCS, *Chairman, Editorial Board, Journal of Medical Ethics*, Sir Brian Windeyer, FRCS FRCPE.

CONFERENCE ON IATROGENIC DISEASE 'Iatrogenic Disease: Not Quite What The Doctor Ordered' was the subject of the 12th Annual Conference of the London Medical Group, organized in conjunction with the Society for the Study of Medical Ethics, and held at the Middlesex

Hospital Medical School on Friday and Saturday, 21 and 22 March. The Conference was heavily oversubscribed and the 400 people who could be accommodated included 300 medical, nursing, and other students, and 100 doctors and members of the allied professions. Principal speakers included Dr John Todd (Medical Treatment: Theory or Practice); Dr Ivan Illich (Clinical Damage, Medical Monopoly, The Expropriation of Health: three dimensions of iatrogenic tort); Dr C R B Joyce, Dr Donald Gould, Professor D R Laurence (Drugs: the Side Issues of Side Effects); Mr C W Jamieson, Mr W F M Hudson, QC, Professor Charles Fletcher (Acceptable Risks); Professor Marshall Marinker (Why Make People Patients?); Miss Katharine Whitehorn (Not Quite What the Patient Ordered); Professor Edmund Leach (Society's Expectation of Health). The sessions were chaired by Dr Cicely Saunders, Dr R D Catterall, *Chairman LMG Consultative Council*, Mr Douglas Ranger, and Professor Desmond Pond. In the final session Dr Illich's paper on 'The Recovery of the Right to Health' was followed by a multidisciplinary discussion, chaired by Professor A S Duncan, *Vice-Chairman EMG Consultative Council*, who also summed up the conference. Case histories were presented by three junior doctors. Dr Roger Higgs, Dr Andrew Whitelaw, and Dr John Bull.

The President of the London Medical Group, Mr John Sedgwick (St Thomas's Hospital Medical School), who convened the Conference, presided throughout. Mr Tim Helme (Middlesex Hospital Medical School) was conference steward, and was assisted by 20 students who were LMG representatives.

DOCUMENTATION IN MEDICAL ETHICS: ON EUTHANASIA

A new series of *Documentation* is to be published by the Society. Each issue will consist of a folder of

articles already published in both medical and non-medical journals. The first of the new series will be devoted to euthanasia and will be available to Associates of the Society at the reduced price of £1 per copy, inclusive of postage; overseas £2 (inclusive of postage). *Documentation* may be purchased by non-associates for £2.50 per copy; overseas £3.50 (both inclusive of postage).

GENERAL

The Society maintains a secretariat at Tavistock House East, Woburn Walk, London WC1H 9LG. Tel 01-387 8132, telegrams MEDETHIC London WC1. The Society, which is non-partisan and independent of all medical, political, religious, or social interest groups, has a multidisciplinary staff:

Director of Studies: The Revd Edward F Shotter, BA

Assistant Director: Dr Anthony Thorley, MA MB MRCPsych
Secretaries: Miss Penny Stewart, SRN, Mrs Helen Horton

Recent grants and donations

HM The Queen has honoured the London Medical Group with a donation for its work in the 12 London teaching hospitals and medical schools.

SOCIETY FOR THE STUDY OF MEDICAL ETHICS

Grants totalling £45000 have been made to the Society by the Ernest Kleinwort and Sir Cyril Kleinwort Charitable Trusts with special respect to the *Journal of Medical Ethics*.

LONDON MEDICAL GROUP

The King Edward the VII Hospital Fund for London has awarded a grant of £5000 to the London Medical Group for the current academic year. Other grants have been received from the Wellcome Foundation, the London Rubber Company, the Discovery Foundation, the London Hospital Medical

College, St Mary's Hospital Medical School, St Thomas's Hospital Medical School, and University College Hospital Medical School.

EDINBURGH MEDICAL GROUP

A grant of £5000 has been awarded to the Edinburgh Medical Group by the Nuffield Provincial Hospitals Trust for a pilot research project into death and bereavement, and one of £18 000 by the Leverhulme Trust for a study of priorities in health care.

Lectures and symposia

APRIL

Edinburgh University Medical School 5.15 pm

Monday 21 April 1975 EMG symposium 'Research: the right to know'

Professor A P M Forrest, Dr D McIntosh, Dr D M Ross

Glasgow Royal Infirmary 5.30 pm
Thursday 25 April 1975 GMG symposium 'The rights of the fetus and the child'

Professor Edward McGirr, Professor Ian Donald, Professor T Campbell, Mr R Fraser

London Charing Cross Hospital, Fulham 6.00 pm

Tuesday 29 April 1975 LMG symposium 'The right of children to be born healthy'

Dr Hugh Jolly, Dr Rodney Harris, Professor C R Austin

MAY

London Guy's Hospital Medical School 5.45 pm

Thursday 1 May 1975 LMG symposium 'Social justice and excellence in medical care'

Mr J D Maynard, Dr J Tudor Hart, Dr F T Sai, Canon David Jenkins
Newcastle Royal Victoria Infirmary 5.15 pm

Friday 2 May 1975 NMG symposium 'Private medicine: has it a future?'

Dr G Davidson, Professor C K Rowley, Professor J Stevens
Edinburgh University Medical School 5.15 pm

Monday 5 May 1975 EMG symposium 'Stress and doctors'
Professor R C B Aitken, Dr A G Donald

London King's College Hospital Medical School 5.45 pm

Tuesday 6 May 1975 LMG symposium 'Experiments on children'
Dr P J Watkins, Dr Kenneth Rogers, Dr Bernard Lawrence
Bristol Royal Infirmary 7.30 pm

Tuesday 6 May 1975 BMG symposium 'Too old - why care?'

Mr David Hobman, Dr A A Baker, Mr W B Harbert, Dr G R Burston
London Middlesex Hospital Medical School 5.45 pm

Tuesday 13 May 1975 LMG symposium 'Drug addiction and the GP'

Dr Philip Boyd, Dr Thomas Bewley, Dr Francis Wells

Sheffield

Tuesday 13 May 1975 SMG lecture 'Does euthanasia help?'

Dr R G Twycross

London Royal Free Hospital School of Medicine 5.45 pm

Thursday 15 May 1975 LMG symposium 'Vagrancy: will it ever go away?'

Professor C P Douglas, Professor John Wing, Mr James Horn

London St Bartholomew's Hospital 5.45 pm

Tuesday 20 May 1975 LMG symposium 'Psychological sequelae of abortion decisions'

Dr B D Fraser, Dr Elizabeth Tylden, Miss Eva Learner

London St George's Hospital Tooting 6.00 pm

Thursday 22 May 1975 LMG symposium 'Medical evidence to the courts'

Dr Paul D'orban, Professor T C N Gibbens, Mr Michael Power

London St Mary's Hospital Medical School 5.45 pm

Tuesday 27 May 1975 LMG symposium 'Medical care in prison'
Dr Harold Edwards, Dr Dorothy Speed, Dr W J Gray

London St Thomas's Hospital 5.45 pm

Thursday 29 May 1975 LMG symposium 'Guilt: normal or abnormal?'

Dr William Kraemer, Mr John Mead

Glasgow Royal Infirmary 5.30 pm

Thursday 30 May 1975 GMG symposium 'Intensive care - a necessary evil?'

Professor Jennett, Dr I Ledingham, Miss D Kilgour

JUNE

Edinburgh University Medical School 5.15 pm

Monday 2 June 1975 EMG lecture 'The health budget'

Professor A L Cochrane

London Westminster Medical School 6.15 pm

LMG symposium 'The Adolescent Patient: the problem of the "family" doctor'

Dr Mary Coghlan, Dr G H Curtis Jenkins

The lectures and symposia listed above are addressed primarily to medical students and nurses and are open to students and others professionally interested. Further information about the LMG from the Administrative Secretary, Miss Penny Stewart, SRN, London Medical Group, Tavistock House East, Woburn Walk, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9LG.

London The London Hospital Medical College 5.45 pm

Tuesday 10 June 1975 LMG symposium 'The rights of the fetus'
Mr J Hartgill, Dr P T O'Neill, Dr Alastair Campbell

Bristol The Royal Infirmary 7.30 pm

Tuesday 17 June 1975 BMG symposium 'Not another overdose?'
Dr H Gethin Morgan, Dr C J Burns Cox, Mr David Moseley, Dr A M Snaith