this section is so subjective that the arguments supporting prenatal diagnosis and selective termination of affected pregnancies are merely posed, then immediately dismissed. Any discussion is so biased as hardly to merit being described as such; rather, the book constitutes a constant and unashamed diatribe against the use of prenatal diagnosis in any form other than as a therapeutic means of identifying treatable disorders.

It is unfortunate that the book is published at a time when the abortion laws in this country are undergoing radical, liberal revision, since a discussion of the imminent changes to the 1967 Act has not been included. Indeed, the author's early remark that 'it is ... quite possible that before the end of this century we shall see many of the more liberal laws (concerning abortion) repealed or amended restrictively' is, in retrospect, rather far from the truth. One might be forgiven for construing it as wishful thinking.

VIRGINIA N BOLTON
Senior Embryologist/Honorary Lecturer, Assisted Conception Unit, Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, King's College School of Medicine and Dentistry, University of London.

Loss and Bereavement


It is understandable that a journal of medical ethics should select for review, publications with an obvious focus on ethical issues. Although this book does not lay claim to such a focus, I am pleased that the attention of readers of this journal is being directed to it. Of course, any text dealing with human crises must encompass ethical issues or dilemmas, either explicitly or implicitly. Professional carers specifically, confronted with human beings in grief for whatever reasons, must be aware of the ethical foundations on which the caring process is based. The two authors clearly demonstrate such awareness. Their sensitivity to the bereaved person's rights, dignity and individuality permeates the text throughout.

The book makes an important contribution to the understanding of loss in its widest sense to include not only death, but also events like the loss of status, of a relationship, of a faculty or of material possessions. The reader is taken right through the complex process of the loss experience and the subsequent grief. Available literature and the authors' personal experiences are used as signposts. The resulting volume achieves an admirable balance between generalisable practical guidelines and most careful attention to individual needs and problems. For example, two flow charts, taken from Which Books 1986 simplify the practical arrangements after death and in relation to the funeral, which bereaved people often find so bewildering. They are excellent general guidelines. The constant emphasis on the need for individual assessment as a basis for appropriate after-care demonstrates the importance of individual differences.

A reading list for the bereaved and a list of useful addresses are added benefits.

Although there seems to be a distinct decrease in the taboo surrounding death in Western society, there remains a good deal of confusion, anxiety and fear. This clear, informative, sensitive and well presented publication provides valuable help for those who attempt to care for bereaved persons.

LISBETH HOCKEY
Research Consultant, Flat 2, Silverknowes House, I Silverknowes Road, Edinburgh 4

Ethics and Human Values in Family Planning

Z Bankowski, J Bazelatto, AM Capron, 308 pages, Geneva, 20 SFR (UK price unstated), Council for International Organisations of Medical Sciences (CIOMS), 1989

This book is derived from the XXII CIOMS Conference held in Bangkok in 1988. However, in comparison with many similar volumes of proceedings from multi-disciplinary conferences its layout has been arranged to state first, an objective, second, the material for deliberation and finally such consensus as was derived. The material is not laid out succinctly and in some respects this is a difficult volume to follow. However, once the reader has begun to find his or her way through the contributions it does become a very readable and very original book.

The phrase 'family planning' encompasses a wide range of activities in reproductive medicine including abortion, sterilisation, treatment and research into infertility and prenatal diagnosis - the whole field of reproductive medicine. The book commences with full coverage in the first six pages of the remarks made at the opening of the conference. These serve to underline the WHO's concern with the issues facing family planning worldwide and the need to find common ground amid the wide range of medical, sociological, philosophical, religious and political factors influencing the provision of reproductive health care globally. These remarks are echoed in the keynote address by Dr Anne MacIeran. Apart from re-stating the conference objective, this contribution is an excellent introduction to the material discussed elsewhere. Two subsequent sections of the book examine from two different perspectives, the spectrum of issues under consideration. First, four chapters deal with ethical, cultural and religious, scientific and legal perspectives. Each of these is written by acknowledged experts in their own field who have chosen language easily understandable by colleagues in other disciplines. The following section examines the same complex array of issues from a regional point of view, with chapters dealing with Africa, Latin America, Europe and North America, Asia and Oceania and finally the Middle East. Most of these concentrate on historical and demographical factors that modify or are modified by cultural and religious settings, an aspect of the problem that is often overlooked in less internationally orientated works. Such consensus as was derived is enumerated, first in the reports of six working groups that dealt with family planning and health services, family planning methods, infertility, prenatal diagnosis and research in fertility and infertility. Further consolidation of views is given in a series of reflections on the conference from the perspectives of an ethicist, a lawyer, a bio-medical scientist, a social scientist, a health-policy maker and a lay person. In view of the thoroughness with which this topic is explored, I can thoroughly recommend this book to anyone involved in reproductive medicine either internationally or in any setting that could be vaguely construed as multicultural.
If any single message is conveyed by
this work it is that the mere existence of
the immense plurality of opinion in this
field actually denies the possibility of
absolute truths. If any exception is seen
it is the need to maintain the patient's
autonomy of choice, based on sound
information.

DAVID R Bromham
Senior Lecturer and Honorary Consultant
in Obstetrics and Gynaecology,
Department of Obstetrics and
Gynaecology,
St James's Hospital, Leeds

Medical Law: Text and Materials
Ian Kennedy and Andrew Grubb,
1224 pages, London, £30.00,
Butterworths, 1989

Whether or not they have been entirely
ever happy about the process, the courts
have been required increasingly
frequently to pronounce on matters
touching on medical ethics. In decisions
on a wide range of subjects, judges have
been obliged to decide not just what the
legal rule is, but what is the morally
acceptable response to a particular
problem. This has given rise to a body of
jurisprudence which cannot be
ignored by those with an interest in the
subject. One could not, for example,
discuss the British response to the issue
of teenage access to contraception fully
without a nod in the direction of the
Gillick decision. Nor would a debate on
attitudes in the United Kingdom to the
sterilisation of the mentally
handicapped be complete without some
reference to the several decisions which
the British courts have now handed
down on this morally difficult matter.

In this weighty (over twelve hundred
pages) collection of medico-legal
materials, Ian Kennedy and Andrew
Grubb have borrowed their way
through a vast mountain of court
decisions, legislation and legal
commentary, to come up with a
compilation of the legal response to
both old and new medical problems.
The value of this enterprise to the
lawyer is self-evident, particularly in
an area of the law which has spawned
a notoriously large literature. But what is
there here for the non-lawyer - for the
broad constituency of those interested
in medical ethics?

There is a great deal. From the very
beginning of their exhaustive
enterprise, the authors stress the inter-
relationship of law and ethics in this
area. The law is seen as one way of
resolving certain immediate
uncertainties or disputes, but the
ethical dimension of what might
otherwise be mistaken for a narrow legal
issue is not ignored. Then, in each of the
topics subsequently addressed, ethical
issues are raised and discussed. But this
of itself is probably no reason for the
book to be read by the reader interested
in medical ethics; the ethical material
 excerpted is usually from familiar
sources (the President’s Commission,
Beauchamp and Childress etc). The real
attraction for such a reader will be the
legal treatment itself. Many reports are
difficult to get hold of, as may also be
the case with statutes or the reports of
government bodies. This book
reproduces the relevant section of
the judgements or the legislation, thus
providing ready access to the essence of
the legal problem.

This is particularly useful in relation
to the American court decisions
reproduced here. Although Kennedy
and Grubb concentrate on English law,
the decisions of other common law
countries, including those of the United
States, are quoted where appropriate.
Thus, for example, there are
reproduced here some of the more
important American decisions on the
cessation of treatment in hopeless cases,
an area of the law on which there is very
little British authority (apart from the
decision in one or two cases involving
the treatment of mentally handicapped
children). For those interested in the
problem of the excessive prolongation of
life, the facts of these cases - and the
legal response - give considerable
flesh to an issue which might otherwise
remain a theoretical debate.

There is now a reasonable choice of
general textbooks on medico-legal
issues available to the non-legal reader.
This book takes this process further, in
providing such a reader with direct and
helpfully guided access to the raw
materials of the legal debate. For this
reason, it is of immense value and
interest.

ALEXANDER McCall Smith
Senior Lecturer,
Faculty of Law,
University of Edinburgh

The Misfortunes of Others: End-stage
Renal Disease in the United Kingdom

Thomas Halper, 219 pages,
Cambridge, £25.00, Cambridge

I have experienced great difficulties in
reviewing this book. This is partly
because I am, as an economist, unclear
why the book was written, or from what
specific perspective, since nowhere is
the author or his background described.
The book covers various
considerations regarding end-stage
erenal disease in the United Kingdom. It
presents in chapter 1 some useful
comparative data concerning renal
dialysis and transplantation in the UK
vis-a-vis such activities in other
countries. Chapter 2 deals with what is
called ‘macro allocation’, essentially
looking at resource allocation under the
UK National Health Service; chapter 3
concerns ‘micro allocation’ i.e decision-
making with respect to resource
allocation in the specific context of
end-stage renal disease; and the fourth
and final chapter offers what are called
‘some premature conclusions’.

Having agreed to review this book, I
then found myself wading through too
many platitudes, together with
contradictory statements and nuances,
ever quite knowing where the author
sought to lead me.

A couple of comments may exemplify
why I am so unhappy with this book.
On page 120 the author states -
apparently in some degree of horror or,
at a minimum, distaste - a nephrologist
who was interviewed volunteered that
he and his colleagues prescribed lower
dosages of some drugs in order to save
money'. But so what? Why is saving
money - which might be better used
elsewhere - seemingly so wrong?

On page 117, the author states: 'It is
test, of course, that treating only
patients with the best prognoses is the
most effective use of scarce resources;
more patients per unit of resources can
be treated in this way than by any
alternative approach. Some observers
might retort, however, that efficiency is
not the highest value. Ought dialyzing
ten Charles Mansons be preferred to
dialyzing five Mozarts (or five of my
saintly uncles) merely because the
Mansons have better prognoses?'

There are several problems with this.
First it is not the case that the statement
‘treating only patients with the best
Ethics and Human Values in Family Planning

David R Bromham

*J Med Ethics* 1990 16: 219-220
doi: 10.1136/jme.16.4.219-a

Updated information and services can be found at:
http://jme.bmj.com/content/16/4/219.2.citation

These include:

**Email alerting service**
Receive free email alerts when new articles cite this article. Sign up in the box at the top right corner of the online article.

Notes

To request permissions go to:
http://group.bmj.com/group/rights-licensing/permissions

To order reprints go to:
http://journals.bmj.com/cgi/reprintform

To subscribe to BMJ go to:
http://group.bmj.com/subscribe/